

## Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

Pope Francis is encouraging the Faithful even to risk sin in order to spread the Gospel.<sup>1</sup> For risking sin toward the same end, Charles E. Curran comes to mind.<sup>2</sup> Curran is a theologian speaking truth to hierarchic power. As best it can, the hierarchic Church is shunting Curran away from its sense of evangelization. For example, Curran points out, just because the hierarchy proclaims a behavior mortally sinful, practice shows that is not always true. For example, sometimes people will use artificial means of birth control out of love of God and creation. Plainly, these people are not disowning God through mortal sin; but, rather, are doing the best they can to own up to Divine love.

---

## **Readings**

First Reading:	Exodus 17:3-7
Responsorial Psalm:	Psalm 95:1-2, 6-7, 8-9 (8)
Second Reading:	Romans 5:1-2, 5-8
Verse before the Gospel:	cf. John 4:42, 15
Gospel:	John 4:5-42

## **Annotated Bibliography**

Musings above the solid line draw from material below. Those uninterested in scholarly and tangential details should stop reading here. If they do, however, they may miss some interesting details.

As of this Reading 025A, March 16, 2014, I changed my annotations. What I had been doing is copying verbatim. Even with footnotes, this risks plagiarism. What copying does do, however, is keep my personal biases out of the presentation of another's work. Such objectivity is helpful for racial research. As I approach my eightieth birthday, two other factors arise. First, my biases are set. Why not let them influence how I present the research of others by using my words rather than theirs. Second, my memory, which is not what it used to be. When I read something, I will not be able to remember it very well. My intention is to repeat this paragraph twice more, before relegating it to the Appendix.

---

<sup>1</sup> Joshua J. McElwee, January 3, 2014, "Francis tells religious to 'wake the world,' outlines modern struggles for church," [http://ncronline.org/blogs/ncr-today/francis-tells-religious-wake...\(accessed January 4, 2014\)](http://ncronline.org/blogs/ncr-today/francis-tells-religious-wake...(accessed January 4, 2014))..

<sup>2</sup> See A Call to Fidelity: On the Moral Theology of Charles E. Curran, James J. Walter, Timothy E. O'Connell, Thomas A. Shannon, eds., (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2002).

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

**Exodus 17:3-7**

Personal Notes cites members of the Protestant Revolt in the spirit of Gerald O'Collins, S.J., writing,<sup>3</sup>

In fact, by allowing the liturgy to be celebrated in the vernacular, by stressing “the table of God’s word” along with the importance of the homily (no. 52), and by granting to the laity—although restricted to certain circumstances—communion “under both kinds” (no. 55), Vatican II conceded the demands of Martin Luther and other 16<sup>th</sup>-century Protestant reformers, albeit in the 20<sup>th</sup>-century. In short, while SC [Sacrosanctum concilium [sic]] did not use explicitly the language of “reform” or “reformation,” what it enacted can and should be described in those terms.

From Reading 025A for March 16, 2014, the Second Sunday of Lent, I intend to identify Protestant revolutionaries with parenthetical dates after their names. I expect readers to realize that Ignatius Loyola (1491-1556), the Council of Trent 1545-1563) and Vincent de Paul (1580-1660) are Roman Catholic landmarks and not Protestant revolutionaries. My intention is to repeat this paragraph twice more, before relegating it to the Appendix.

Exod 17:1-7

Philip Melanchthon (1497-1560), “Notes on Paul’s Letter to the Colossians 3:15”<sup>4</sup>  
Melanchthon makes the point that God punishes to build up, not destroy.

Exod 17:1-7

Jeff Cavins, Tim Gray, and Sarah Christmyer, The Bible Timeline: The Story of Salvation<sup>5</sup>

Cavins invites the Faithful to reflect on three temptations: Adam and Eve; the Israelites in the desert; and Jesus. In all three, the conflict is between truth and power, which will determine which. Only Jesus insists that the power of God overwhelms any other truth. The Cavins-Opus Dei approach to Sacred Scripture systematically avoids the problems of Modernism, whereby, for example, every time Sacred Scripture uses the name of Moses, it cannot mean the historical Moses.

---

<sup>3</sup> Theological Studies, Vol. 73, No. 4 (December 2012) 772.

<sup>4</sup> in Reformation Commentary on Scripture: New Testament XI: Philippians, Colossians, Graham Tomlin (ed.) in collaboration with Gregory B. Graybill, general editor, Timothy George, associate General editor, Scott M. Manetsch, (Downers Grove, Illinois: IVP Academic: An imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2013) 228.

<sup>5</sup> West Chester, Pennsylvania: Ascension Press, 2004, 2011, Session 18, pages 127 and 2.

## Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

Exod 17:4

Martyr Vermigli (1499-1562), "Commentary on Genesis 7:24" <sup>6</sup>

Vermigli proclaims that when punishment is joined to sin, the ravages of sin are lessened. Punished, the sinner is less likely to sin again. Vermigli makes the point focusing on Noah and the ark.

Exod 17:5

Eric John Wyckoff, S.D.B., "When Does Translation Become Exegesis? Exodus 24:9-11 in the Masoretic Text and the Septuagint" <sup>7</sup>

Wyckoff points to the difference between γερουσια and πρεσβυτερος argue that the Greek choice for *elders* is a matter of "linguistic exegesis."

Exod 17:6

David G. Schultenover, S.J., "From the Editor's Desk" <sup>8</sup>

*Strike the rock, and the water will flow from it for the people to drink* is an expression of hope for things to come from Sacred Scripture. Jesus Christ is the New Testament rock.

## **Psalm 95:1-2, 6-7, 8-9 (8)**

The Church uses this Psalm in Care for the Sick. <sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> in Reformation Commentary on Scripture: Old Testament I: Genesis I—II, (ed.) John L. Thompson (Downers Grove, Illinois: IVP Academic, An Imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2012) 268.

<sup>7</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 74, No. 4 (October 2012) 681.

<sup>8</sup> Theological Studies, Vol. 72, No. 2 (June 2011) 245.

<sup>9</sup> The Roman Ritual: Revised by Decree of the Second Vatican Ecumenical Council and Published by Authority of Pope Paul VI: Pastoral Care of the Sick: Rites of Anointing and Viaticum: Approved for use in the dioceses of the United States of America by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops and Confirmed by the Apostolic See: Prepared by International Commission on English in the Liturgy: a Joint Commission of Catholic Bishops' Conferences (New York: Catholic Book Publishing Co. 1983) 34, 38.

## Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

Psalm 95:1

Gianni Barbiero, "Psalm 132: A Prayer of `Solomon'"<sup>10</sup>

Barbiero argues that *Come, let us sing joyfully to the LORD* is a result of justice, rather than liturgical action or Divine predilection alone.

Psalm 95:7-8

Jacobus Arminius (1559-1609), "Disputation on Repentance"<sup>11</sup>

Arminius argues that repentance delayed risks hardening of the heart, to the point that repentance becomes impossible.

### **Romans 5:1-2, 5-8**

Rom 5:1-21

Elsa Tamez, "A Latin American Rereading of Romans 7"<sup>12</sup>

*While we were still helpless*, Rom 5:5 brings out the argument Tamez makes that the first part of Romans is about unredeemed humanity. The key to Romans is living life in light of the Resurrection.

Rom 5:1<sup>13</sup>

According to Melanchthon, repentance is the first act of Faith. The fullness of faith that follows is a peaceful conscience. According to Georg Major (1502-1574), a peaceful conscience enables the Faithful to judge even prophets, let alone the Church hierarchy.

---

<sup>10</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 75, No. 2 (April 2013) 248.

<sup>11</sup> in Reformation Commentary on Scripture: New Testament XI: Philippians, Colossians, Graham Tomlin (ed.) in collaboration with Gregory B. Graybill, general editor, Timothy George, associate General editor, Scott M. Manetsch, (Downers Grove, Illinois: IVP Academic: An imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2013) 58.

<sup>12</sup> in Translating the New Testament: Text, Translation, Theology, Stanley E. Porter and Mark J. Boda (eds.) (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2009) 294.

<sup>13</sup> in Reformation Commentary on Scripture: New Testament XI: Philippians, Colossians, Graham Tomlin (ed.) in collaboration with Gregory B. Graybill, general editor, Timothy George, associate General editor, Scott M. Manetsch, (Downers Grove, Illinois: IVP Academic: An imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2013) 8, Major, "Sermon on Philippians 1:9-11," 15-16; 111, Melanchthon, "Notes on Paul's Letter to the Colossians 1:2," 131; Melanchthon, "Notes on Paul's Letter to the Colossians 2:11-13," 193, fn. 48; 228.

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

Rom 5:1-11

William J. Shaules, review of Michael J. Gorman, Inhabiting the Cruciform God: Kenosis, Justification, and Theosis in Paul's Narrative Soteriology<sup>14</sup>

Shaules reports that Gorman argues that justification and participation in Divine life belong together and not apart from one another. Carrying the Cross is the means to the free grace of both justification and participation. Gorman tends to over-simplify his theses.

Rom 5:1-2

F. Gerald Downing, "Justification as Acquittal? A Critical Examination of Judicial Verdicts in Paul's Literary and Actual Contexts"<sup>15</sup>

Downing argues that Paul removes all punitive threats from God, because Jesus Christ has absorbed all punishment due to sin.

Rom 5:5-7

Alicia J. Batten, review of Arthur J. Dewey, Roy W. Hoover, Lane C. McGaughey, and Daryl D. Schmidt (trans.), The Authentic Letters of Paul: A New Reading of Paul's Rhetoric and Meaning The Scholars Version<sup>16</sup>

Batten reports that Romans 1:5-7, *only with difficulty does one die for a just* person, is an interpolation that the authors accept. The text under review is a reasonable introduction to Paul.

Romans 5:5

"Encyclical Letter Lumen Fidei of the Supreme Pontiff Francis to the Bishops, Priests, and deacons [sic] and lay Faithful on Faith"<sup>17</sup>

Pope Francis cites *hope does not disappoint* as an incentive to keep trying to bring the Kingdom of God to earth, despite difficulties and suffering.

---

<sup>14</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 73, No. 2 (April 2011) 382.

<sup>15</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 74, No. 2 (April 2012) 317.

<sup>16</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 74, No. 3 (July 2012) 598.

<sup>17</sup> L'Osservatore Romano: Weekly Edition in English, Vol. 46, No. 28 (2304), Vatican City Wednesday, 10 July, 2013, paragraph 57, page 21.

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

Romans 5:5

Richard Rohr, Falling Upward: A Spirituality for the Two Halves of Life<sup>18</sup>

What the Lectionary translates as *the Holy Spirit who has been given to us*, Rohr translates as *the Holy Spirit that has been given to us*. The Holy Spirit is a *who* rather than a *that*. Both translations used the lower case for *who* and *that*.

**cf. John 4:42, 15**

**John 4:5-42**

John 4:42

Philip W. Comfort, New Testament Text and Translation Commentary: Commentary on the variant readings of the ancient New Testament manuscripts and how they relate to the major English translations<sup>19</sup>

The King James Version and others add, *the Christ* in apposition *the savior of the world*. *The Christ* diminishes *of the world*. Ancients liked to multiply titles and that seems to be what happened here.

John 4:7-42

Mary Collins and Edward Foley, "Mystagogy: Discerning the Mystery of Faith"<sup>20</sup>

*The disciples urged him, "Rabbi eat"* (John 4:31). The Roman judicial system crucified Jesus because of those with whom he ate. Jesus violated Jewish meal rituals. This practice of Jesus helps making a prudential judgment in the Communion Wars. Cardinal Raymond Burke would refuse Communion to legislators whose policies he disapproves. Cardinal Donald Wuerl admits those same legislators to the Communion Table.

John 4:10-14, 42

Richard Rohr, Falling Upward: A Spirituality for the Two Halves of Life<sup>21</sup>

Rohr misquotes Sacred Scripture. Where Rohr has *the spring within her will well up unto eternal life* (John 4:14), the Lectionary has, *a spring of water welling up to eternal life*. On the slippery basis of his translation, what else Rohr may mean and why is also slippery.

---

<sup>18</sup> San Francisco: Jossey-Bass: A Wiley Imprint, 2011, 91.

<sup>19</sup> Carol Stream, Illinois: Tyndale House Publishers, Inc., 2008,

<sup>20</sup> in A Commentary on the Order of Mass of The Roman Missal: A New English Translation: Developed under the Auspices of the Catholic Academy of Liturgy, Edward Foley (ed.) (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2011) 84.

<sup>21</sup> San Francisco: Jossey-Bass: A Wiley Imprint, 2011, 68, (source of the quote) 96; 108.

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

John 4:14

Richard E. McCarron, "Theology of the Latin Text and Rite"<sup>22</sup>

With an oblique reference to John 4:14, the Preface in the Mass for Various Needs refers to God as the font of life. Such an approach is problematic when it divorces the academic magisterium from the hierarchic magisterium, as is happening. For example, Pope Paul VI, of the birth control encyclical, proclaimed that the hierarchy did not need theologians. By distancing themselves from Charles Curran, the hierarchy distanced themselves from moral theology itself. Curran is solidly in the tradition of Catholic moral theology.

Daniel C. Maguire expressed the horror of what is happening.<sup>23</sup>

The First Vatican Council added its weight to this confusion when it defined the possibility of making infallible statements through the medium of fallible language. The preparatory committee, the Deputation of the Faith, raised the question of whether the pope had to use ordinary means to reach his infallible conclusions. The answer was that the efficacious nature of "assistance" is such that even a negligent pope would be impeded from making a pronouncement that would be wrong or destructive. "The protection of Christ and the divine assistance promised to the successors of Peter is such an efficacious cause that the judgment of the supreme pontiff, if it were in error and destructive of the church, would be impeded." Pope Paul VI capped this sad theology by saying that the hierarchical magisterium could teach "without the aid of theology" because it "represents Jesus Christ the teacher and is his quasi-instrument."

John 4:19

Daniel B. Wallace, With Scripture, Subject, and Greek Word Indexes: Greek Grammar: Beyond the Basics: An Exegetical Syntax of the New Testament<sup>24</sup>

Wallace unpacks the Greek to see what the Samaritan woman means when she says, *Sir, I can see that you are a prophet*. She seems not to be numbering Jesus among the prophets, but to be describing his attributes.

---

<sup>22</sup> in A Commentary on the Order of Mass of The Roman Missal: A New English Daniel C. Maguire, "Introduction: Charles E. Curran: Catholic Theologian, Priest, Prophet" Foley (ed.) (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2011) 565.

<sup>23</sup> Daniel C. Maguire, "Introduction: Charles E. Curran: Catholic Theologian, Priest, Prophet," in A Call to Fidelity: On the Moral Theology of Charles E. Curran, James J. Walter, Timothy E. O'Connell, Thomas A. Shannon, eds., (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2002) 11

<sup>24</sup> Grand Rapids: Michigan: Zondervan, 1996, **265-66**, 324, 456, 528, 678.

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

John 4:20

Jeff Cavins, Tim Gray, and Sarah Christmyer, The Bible Timeline: The Story of Salvation<sup>25</sup>

Cavins correctly asserts that forgiveness of others is essential for forgiveness of self, especially from God. In elitist Opus Dei fashion, Cavins leaves no room for including any need to repent on the part of the one forgiven. Such an approach perpetuates systemic abuses associated with child abuse, sexism, and racism.

John 4:21, 23

John Painter, review of Stefanos Mihalios, The Danielic Eschatological Hour in the Johannine Literature<sup>26</sup>

Painter uses the word *hour* at least eighteen times in this review. Painter does not define what he means by *hour*, sixty minutes? Painter reports that Mihalios uses *the hour is coming* as a reference to fulfillment of prophecies of Daniel. Mihalios is convincing.

John 4:23<sup>27</sup>

Calvin, "Commentary on Philippians 3:33"

*Worshipping the Father in Spirit and truth*, means interior worship, as distinct from exterior worship alone.

John 4:24

Fr. Yozefu – B. Ssemakula, The Healing of Families: How To Pray Effectively for Those Stubborn Personal and Familial Problems<sup>28</sup>

Ssemakula argues, *that God is Spirit*, means the Faithful have to pay more attention to their souls than their bodies. In order to hear God, the Faithful have to link their Spirits with God who is Spirit.

---

<sup>25</sup> West Chester, Pennsylvania: Ascension Press, 2004, 2011, Session 15, page 2.

<sup>26</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 75, No. 2 (April 2013) 365.

<sup>27</sup> in Reformation Commentary on Scripture: New Testament XI: Philippians, Colossians, Graham Tomlin (ed.) in collaboration with Gregory B. Graybill, general editor, Timothy George, associate General editor, Scott M. Manetsch, (Downers Grove, Illinois: IVP Academic: An imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2013) 74.

<sup>28</sup> [no publisher or place of publication is listed] [www.healingoffamilies.com](http://www.healingoffamilies.com), 2012, 84, 93.



Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

John 4:42

Patrick Regan, "Theology of the Latin Text and Rite"<sup>29</sup>

The Preface in Eucharistic Prayer II refers to Jesus Christ as Savior and Redeemer, an expression of the mystery of grace flowing into the hearts of the Faithful. John 4:42 is one of the places where the Greek recognizes Jesus Christ as savior. Eucharistic Prayer II is recognizable from the words "You are indeed Holy, O Lord, the fount of all holiness. Make holy, therefore, these gifts, we pray, by sending down your Spirit upon them like the dewfall so that they may become for us the Body and Blood of our Lord Jesus Christ." Priests prefer Eucharistic Prayer II.

John 4:42

Sandra M. Schneiders, "The Lamb of God and the Forgiveness of Sin(s) in the Fourth Gospel"<sup>30</sup>

Schneiders argues that Jesus Christ is the original fulfillment of the original creative act of God; not Plan B. This is the way God has of showing love for all humanity and creation.

John 4:42

35 "...we know that this is truly the savior of the world" (Jn 4:42).<sup>31</sup>

Personal Notes gave up systematically examining the illiterate 2011 Missal November 25, 2012. On April 7, 2013, with Reading 045C 2nd Sunday of Easter\_A Catholic Bible Study 130407, Personal Notes systematically began to incorporate material from A Commentary on the Order of Mass of The Roman Missal: A New English Translation: Developed under the Auspices of the Catholic Academy of Liturgy, Edward Foley (ed.) (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2011). The hope is that this approach will help pray with the new Missal, despite itself.

For more on sources see the Appendix file. A complete set of Personal Notes, dating from the Fifteenth Sunday in Ordinary Time, July 14, 2002 to the present, is on the web site at [www.western-civilization.com/CBQ/Personal%20Notes](http://www.western-civilization.com/CBQ/Personal%20Notes).

---

<sup>29</sup> in A Commentary on the Order of Mass of The Roman Missal: A New English Translation: Developed under the Auspices of the Catholic Academy of Liturgy, Edward Foley (ed.) (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2011) 319 N 7.

<sup>30</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 73, No. 1 (January 2011) 4, 8, 19.

<sup>31</sup> So far I have not identified just where the 2011 Missal uses these verses.

Personal Notes

Third Sunday of Lent\_A Catholic Bible Study Reading 28A, March 23, 2014

© 2014

Raymond J. Jirran, Ph.D.

The Responsorial Antiphon for this Sunday is *If today you hear his voice, harden not your hearts* (Psalm 95:8).<sup>32</sup>

In the gobbledygook prayer at Sunday Mass immediately following the forgiveness of sins, the Faithful hearing the 2011 Roman Missal can listen for “fasting, prayer, and almsgiving”<sup>33</sup>

This is a call for grace that some Black Baptists bring to mind with *Saying with a loud voice, Worthy is the Lamb that was slain to receive power, and riches, and wisdom, and strength, and honour, and glory and blessing* (Revelation 5:12).<sup>34</sup> At John 4:42, above, Sandra M. Schneiders uses the following article, “The Lamb of God and the Forgiveness of Sin(s) in the Fourth Gospel.”<sup>35</sup> These Baptists have a tie-in with mainstream liturgy.

---

<sup>32</sup> National Conference of Catholic Bishops, The Roman Missal Restored by Decree of the Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican and Promulgated by Authority of Pope Paul VI: Lectionary for Mass: For Use in the Dioceses of the United States of America: Second Typical Edition: Volume I: Sundays, Solemnities, Feasts of the Lord and the Saints (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1988) 172. Personal Notes refers to this book as the Lectionary.

<sup>33</sup> n.a., The Roman Missal: Renewed by Decree of the Most Holy Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican, Promulgated by Authority of Pope Paul VI and Revised at the Direction of Pope John Paul II: English Translation According to the Third Typical Edition: For Use in the Dioceses of the United States of America: Approved by the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops and Confirmed by the Apostolic See (Washington, DC, United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2011) 236. Personal Notes refers to this book as the Missal.

<sup>34</sup> UMI Annual Sunday School Lesson Commentary: Precepts for Living ®: 2013-2014: International Sunday School Lessons: Volume 165: UMI (Urban Ministries, Inc.), a. Okechuku Ogonnaya, Ph.D., (ed.) (Chicago, IL 60643: UMI (Urban Ministries, Inc.), 2013) 339-340.

<sup>35</sup> the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 73, No. 1 (January 2011) 4, 8, 19.