

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

A. *Introduction*

Relating Irish immigrants and women and Blacks is useful for correlating Western civilization with the history of the U.S.A. according to chronology, human and non-human ecology, and degree of certitude warranted. Correlating Western civilization with the history of the U.S.A. by **evaluating international relations** is the course goal for this topic. Student readings focus on Europe. This handout focuses on the U.S.A. connection.

B. *Irish History*

Since there are more Irish on this side of the Pond, i.e., the Atlantic Ocean, than in Ireland, some special comments are in order. The 1800 Act of Union abolished the Irish Parliament and joined Ireland, forthwith, to England. Beginning with the 1800 Act of Union, which Chambers does not mention, until the time of the new Reformation of 1822, religious controversialists stayed in the background.¹ Between 1822 and the Irish Potato Famine of 1847, the new Reformation was an internal family affair among the Irish themselves. In the wake of the Great Famine, an evangelical crusade was launched from England. The net result was the withdrawal of the English in 1869.²

A sense of the broad historical patterns can be gleaned from some broad statistics. In 1600, seventy-eight per cent of a Hapsburg bricklayer's family income was spent on food; in 1800, seventy-three per cent. This slight five per cent decline was a sign of better nutrition and material well-being. Grain alone made up approximately half the average daily food intake.³ Although research in this matter is sketchy, the information is important and relevant, both, for understanding the meaning of the Great Famine for the U. S., where there was food aplenty.

C. *Irish Immigrants*

Migration of Roman Catholic Irish began in small numbers after the War of 1812, increasing significantly after the 1830s. Mention is made of this in Topic 11, Napoleon, B. Mortality, paragraph three. By 1855, some 50,000 Irish lived, for example, in the city of Boston, the home of much abolitionism. The period 1822-1860 involved a European Catholic-Protestant upheaval. In 1869, the Irish Protestants were disestablished, causing the collapse of Irish religious pluralism ever since.⁴ U. S. A. Irish Catholics were Americans, in a Protestant environment, in the process of becoming Americanized. One of the first Irish adjustments was related to the abolitionist movement.

The anti-slavery movement was basically Protestant Evangelical. Radical reformers, led by William Lloyd Garrison, tried for an entire generation to obtain Irish sympathy and support. The Garrisonians wanted to identify the causes of Irish European and Black U.S.A. freedom. This type of leadership, however, was not popular with the Irish living in this country. The Irish-Americans did not want to be thought of in common with African Americans.

The Irish living in Ireland, however, had a somewhat different view. One of the great Irish leaders of all time was Daniel O'Connell. This man was actually a hero of the anti-slavery movement. Not only was he opposed to slavery, but he found it as unjust for the American Colonization Society to encourage free Blacks to return to Africa as it was for the English to transport their poor out of England. O'Connell was opposed to slavery and its ramifications in season and out of season throughout his life. But, O'Connell was European, not American.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

D. Romantic Nationalism

While the road U.S.A. and Irish democracy was traveling was rocky, progress did occur. Daniel O'Connell was a wise and effective politician. He once said, "the altar of liberty totters when it is cemented only with blood, when it is supported only with carcasses."⁵ He was also quite orthodox in his religion and at times he needed one to balance the others. For a time in 1843, he openly denounced Garrison for his anti-clericalism,⁶ which O'Connell thought was representative of the entire abolitionist movement in America. This was a misunderstanding as O'Connell eventually came to realize. Things got back on keel.

Other Europeans, such as Mazzini and Garibaldi of Italy, and Kossuth of Hungary, also were reformers of a kind similar to the Garrisonians. In the European context, the revolutions of 1848 made it clear that national independence, like that sought by the Irish, and personal liberty, like that sought by American Blacks, were in fact not the same. Probably many Americans were unaware, for example, that Kossuth appealed to the American revolutionary example to justify a Magyar regime at the expense of Slavonic minorities. But that was not the point. The basic dilemma was that national independence could not guarantee personal liberty. In Europe there were bloody revolutions; in the U.S.A., eventually, the Civil War. Romantic nationalism did not prove strong enough to halt rational democracy.

E. Conclusion

This topic has traced a development of Social Changes in its meaning for both individuals and nations. The incompatible inseparables at work here are those between the supremacy of the territorial state as the "natural" unit of human society and the claim of the church to govern human souls. The focus has been on the Irish, both in this country and in Europe, as well as on the works of the abolitionists in both places. A brief correlation was made with men like Kossuth, Mazzini, and Garibaldi. In this way, the course goal of correlating the mainstream of Western civilization with the history of the U.S.A. by evaluating international relations was accomplished. Students are reminded to read, study, think, and prepare a comment.

Supplement

F. Irish Immigrants (continued)

The potato famine of 1845-49 gave an initial strong push forcing young people to leave Ireland. The Irish also participated in the "new immigration" at the turn of the Twentieth Century. Between 1885 and 1920, there was another rush of Irish immigrants, particularly young women, to the United States. In adopting a single-inheritance, single-dowry system, the Irish practically forced their young women to leave. Because of the greater need to marry in order to survive, the burden to leave fell more heavily on the young women than on the young men. Unless the left-over sons and daughters left, they could neither marry nor work. Only one son could marry and work, only one daughter could receive a dowry to wed.⁷

Writing history from the viewpoint of those governed, rather than the governors, is relatively new. Oral history characterizes those governed; written history, those governing. The result is two different viewpoints. Efforts of the British crown to remove the unprofitable Irish peasants from the land, forced the Irish peasants to rebel and, thereby, enter the written record. Only the famine broke the rebellion and the delicate balance landlords maintained between the Crown and those who farmed the land. This broken balance forced many Irish to leave for places like the United States.⁸

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

Alcoholism was another physical burden. Alcoholism was a disease particularly prevalent in United States Irish families. Since historical research into this disease is largely French, Dr. Jirran awaits other research to confirm the original as well as anecdotal findings. Between 1750 and 1850 there was still little concern over alcoholism as a disease. The French seemed to suffer less than others from alcoholism because the French drank wine, which was less potent than the hard liquor others used.⁹

By mid-century, alcoholism was recognized in medical circles as a disease. The term "alcoholism" was coined in France in 1849. Between 1859 and 1950 the disease concept predominated in the West. Alcoholism is a type of drug abuse. The efforts to limit the ravages of the disease have had limited success.¹⁰

The first anti-alcohol organization appeared in France in 1872. From 1920 until 1933 the efforts of temperance organizations maintained prohibition throughout the United States. Shortages of alcoholic beverages during the Second World War resulted in a marked decrease of incidents of cirrhosis of the liver and admission to mental hospitals. Because this decrease occurred across class lines, alcoholism was no longer regarded as a disease largely confined to the poor.¹¹

Medical research since 1950 has had trouble reinforcing the disease concept. Because people differ widely in their ability to tolerate alcohol, pathological standards have not been established. It is difficult, for example, to know how to treat the fact that some Southeast Asians lack the enzyme which makes drinking alcohol possible. The international component for alcoholism resides not only in the fact that people all over the world suffer from the disease, but also that people all over the world continue to consume alcohol, often preferring types from other areas of the globe, types sometimes more likely to jolt their own biological systems into stupor.¹²

G. Introduction

The view so far has been from a rather traditional male perspective. The view now turns toward a rather non-traditional female perspective. Included are matters of Civil Rights; Economic Rights; Linguistic Rights, even; and Political Rights.

H. Civil Rights

Not to be enslaved is the premier civil right. French emancipation has already been treated in the May 25, 2000 edition of Topic 10, French Revolution, L. Other Ramifications, paragraph 4. That treatment was limited to the French Revolution.

The broader issue is determining who would be in control. Generally the ruling elite softened the impact of emancipation with one or another form of compensation. No where else was it like in the United States where "so many servile laborers liberated in one stroke or soon after [were] provided equivalent civil and political rights."¹³ Class rights are more easily identified outside of the United States, where they are more prevalent.

Even so, what the U. S. Revolution meant for women was not much. Feminine attributes were myopically identified as "attraction to luxury, self-indulgence, timidity, dependence, passion . . . linked to corruption and posed a threat to republicanism."¹⁴ Much remained to be done.

Between 1780 and 1860, women in Britain, France and the U.S. inverted the language of domesticity to claim for themselves positive educational, religious, and inspirational functions.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

This change in language had a technological counterpart. Research has shown that the earlier invention of the chimney had profound effects for women in the house. Research needed to detail what piped water meant for letting women out of the house.¹⁵

The link between feminism and abolition was different in France, Britain, and the U.S. In France, the absence of religious fervor effectively silenced women after the Revolution of 1848. In Britain and the U.S., abolition served as a powerful trigger for wide public consciousness. British feminism got caught up in the politics of class, however. Only in the U.S. did feminism become part of the general reformist ethos, where it has stayed.

Garrisonian abolitionists linked Irish, Black, and women's rights. The history of feminism is relatively brief. As early as 1841-43 English socialists, Owenites, advocated¹⁶ suffrage but the big push in England only came in 1869 with "Essay on the Subjugation of Women" by John Stuart Mill.¹⁷

Robert Owen blamed the subjugation of women in the patriarchal family. Patriarchy supported habits of dominance and selfishness perpetuating the capitalist system. Therein lay the hidden political core of early socialism. This political core was in the public sector, rather than the private sector to which orthodox Marxists relegated women. In a word, Marxists remained politically sexist.

During the era of Victorian feminism, from 1850 to 1904, women were virtually legal slaves. Women were denied educational opportunities. What education was available was different for working-class and middle-class girls. The middle-class girls needed education for employment, whereas working-class girls did not. Women were denied both the vote and participation even in local politics.¹⁸

When it came to job opportunities, middle-class women had to be concerned about "respectability," something working-class women could not afford. "To all intents and purposes, the different classes in Victorian society occupied separate worlds, and one of the major handicaps to really thorough feminist organization was recognized as having its roots in this division."¹⁹

Execution is the ultimate loss of civil rights. This ultimate loss rarely happened to women. Dr. Jirran thinks that students have a sort of macabre interest in the punishment of criminals. After the Revolutionary War, capital punishment went private, at least in the northeastern United States. The 1787 hangings of the Shaysites were denounced as inhumane by many. In the 1830s most northern states hid their gallows behind prison walls. Execution became a sort of private entertainment for elite men who feared rousing mob passions with public executions. In 1849 Boston hanged a Black sailor, the first Boston hanging since 1836. Historians have considerable research to do to present a coherent story.²⁰

I. Economic Rights

In many respects, the feminist issue was economic, just as Marxists would argue. During the industrialization of the U. S. a cult of domesticity developed, whereby middle class women gained a type of moral self-worth, equality with men. The sexes became equal: women working inside the home, men outside. In the Twentieth Century, and largely after the Second World War, women began adding a sense of personal fulfillment to their quest for income. These women, with a sense of self-worth based on the Nineteenth Century cult of domesticity, continue to

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

challenge sex-typing of jobs.²¹ A woman should have access to any job for which she is competent.

Some research done in the city of Petersburg, Virginia for the years 1784-1850 contributed to a better sense of what was happening. It is not as though a lot of research has been done in women's history. In this paragraph, Dr. Jirran is pointing to a direction new research is taking, more than to a summary of long-established research. Women had a virtual monopoly on organizing charitable work. Women were kinder to slaves in their wills than men and also more likely to set slaves free. While most Black women lived in abject poverty, in 1860, half of all Black Petersburg property holders were women.²² Less than half of all White property holders were women. African-American culture was leading the way to greater freedom for all.

Scholars tracing the feminist movement through the Twentieth Century have come to see the nineteen-twenties as a turning point in which women became more interested in combining work and marriage. Research indicates that women actually held on to their jobs better than men during the Great Depression. While the Second World War did materially help women, their social lot went largely unimproved until later.²³

Fundamentally avoiding the feminist issue, Europeans identified Irish rights with Black rights. In 1840, a meeting was held in London, England to help coordinate the anti-slavery movement along international lines. After that meeting, the Garrisonians sat on the sidelines because the Convention failed to grant equal rights to women. The Garrisonians also chastened English abolitionists for supporting freedom abroad while being relatively indifferent to the fact that Ireland was suffering. It is always easier to claim amnesty for someone persecuted in a foreign country.

Understanding the relationship between the work of women and industrialization has been undergoing change. The difficulty of combining wage earning and domestic work has remained remarkably constant.²⁴ In the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries, manufacturing began to disperse throughout Europe. During the early modern era, 1500-1750, much cloth, tin-plates, nails, scythes, and clogs were made. These activities were based on division of labor determined by sex and further corresponding to distinctions between market and household production. Household production was more suited for women. Market production was more suited for men. Industrial era technology, such as steam power, entered a continuum of change, rather than launched a new era.²⁵

A new pattern of understanding, focusing on the adaptive strengths and strategies of women as they consistently sought to mold their employment around their domestic world, is developing. One such recent study, At the Very Least She Pays the Rent: Women and German Industrialization: 1871-1914, develops the contributions of women in the lower class family economy. Domestic production survived precisely because it found in women a cheap source of pliant labor.²⁶

A key for understanding current U. S. feminist scholarship rests in what happened in 1776. The U. S. Revolution perpetuated a distortion and submersion of feminine identity. In reaction, feminist scholarly biographical works mostly stress "a struggle for identity, for visibility, for selfhood in the face of obstacles, whether familiar, social, or personal."²⁷

Australia, between 1830 and 1930, offers some insight into what was happening. The place was big and economic opportunities were available for women. The women most like us were part of a new middle class, people who did not own their means of production or sell their manual labor,

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

but who sold their educational, technical, or social skills. While men and women were treated differently within the same class, class still seemed more important than gender for determining job opportunities. The economic downturn of the 1880s caused men to join together to exclude women from jobs they once held, in the name of the family wage.²⁸ Pope Leo XIII delivered his famous encyclical, Rerum Novarum on this matter supporting living family wages meant for men in 1891.²⁹

The battle of the sexes is ancient. Gerda Lerner has charged that men won the battle of the sexes in precivilized times and that it is about time to even the scales. Before 1870 child-rearing and marriage were statistically co-terminus. Few lived to see their youngest children's children.³⁰

Lerner regards cultural activities as separating humans from nature. "The history of civilization describes the process by which humans have distanced themselves from nature by inventing and perfecting culture."³¹ Dr. Jirran regards the development of culture, for example this Western civilization course, as joining humans to nature. Humans are free either to join with or separate from nature. Culture is not limited to either activity.

Lerner complains that while men no longer need to labor, women still must. Her words, "only women . . . are doomed forever to species-service through their biology."³² Lerner goes on, "Sexual attributes are a biological given, but gender is a product of historical process."³³ It is that very process we are trying to unravel and understand in this course.

Lerner points to Frederick Engels's Origin of the Family, Private Property and the State to impute historic defeat to the female sex as an event deriving from the development of private property. Dr. Jirran has great respect for the scholarship of Gerda Lerner and wishes his comments here, appeared and were less antagonistic toward her approach. When Dr. Jirran says that historians treat women as prizes of war and that women do not much object as they display their assets waggling across campus, his insights derive from Lerner. Dr. Jirran agrees with Lerner that such treatment is inappropriate. Dr. Jirran regards the study of history as the study of developing identity. It is neither in the best interests of individuals within Western civilization nor in the best interests of Western civilization itself to treat women as prizes of war. By pointing out that such treatment is part of what actually happens, Dr. Jirran expects the diligent student to realize, not that Dr. Jirran is either sexist or misogynist, but that a non self-righteous adjustment is in order.

Statistics show that in 1981 women constituted more than ninety-nine per cent of all secretaries, but less than one per cent of all automobile mechanics; ninety-seven per cent of all registered nurses, but only four per cent of all engineers.³⁴ Women tended to be in the service industries. Jobs tended to be sex-typed.

A recent study of department store clerks unveils much of what is going on. The clerks tend to be female, the managers male. Clerks have learned to fight off sexual harassment through the use of the salesclerks' huddle. In such huddles, women used the same power exercised by skilled male workers on the shop floor.³⁵ The point is that women workers react to management much like male workers.

The problem was that the male managers had to give up direct control over the relationship between women salesclerks and their customers. That special feminine bonding involved "skills

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

of social interaction that, although devalued in society, were useful in department store selling.³⁶ The usefulness of these skills, in turn, helped to raise feminine consciousness throughout society.

Women gradually worked themselves into the trade unions. The feminist movement of the early 1970s made it a point to destroy the myth that women form an idle, candy-eating lot, a generation of vipers. The effectiveness of this myth-destruction is felt by the professor whenever he mentions soap operas in class.³⁷ Women object to being thought of as watching the soaps all day long.

Traditional assumptions about the intellectual inferiority and domestic obligations of women have damaged their intellectual potentials. That these assumptions have changed is a given, but the history of how and why this happened remains to be written. The problem was that by writing about those who overcame obstacles to become successful, one implied that the unsuccessful had themselves to blame.³⁸ Karl Marx pointed the way to a better analysis with his class-based theory. Structural analysis was the even more sophisticated approach. What to look for was an approach in which the expansion of opportunity for some becomes synonymous with the equality of opportunity for all. Research continues to probe understanding.

Study of Renaissance writing comes away stressing the importance of patriarchy with the overwhelming power and presence of men and the omission or distortion of women in works written by women themselves. There is an outworn stereotype that held that industrialization caused the household to lose all useful functions. Historians recognized that both production and reproduction were recast to fit the new industrialized era.³⁹

Cottage, or in-the-house, industry dominated England through the end of the Seventeenth Century. Though the statistic appears correct, it seems too much to claim that:

The dynamic of the bourgeois marriage was founded by Protestantism at the same time that the bourgeois class was undertaking its two great historical tasks: wresting political power from the feudal aristocracy and seizing the means of production from the working class. Until 1850 the majority of the population in England was agricultural.⁴⁰

J. Linguistic Rights

Dr. Jirran maintains that when speakers use "you know" they are signifying that they are a victim of their language not affording the tools with which to express what they want to say. Deconstructionists, in the person of Derrida, are more abstract, ". . . to name, to give names . . . such is the ordinary violence of language which consists in inscribing within a difference, in classifying, in suspending the vocative absolute." The problem for feminism has been more specifically spelled out by Mary Daly in Beyond God the Father (1973). "It is necessary to grasp the fundamental fact that women have had the power of 'naming' stolen from us. We have not been free to use our own power to name ourselves, the world, or God."⁴¹ Dr. Jirran joins with the feminists in recognizing a sense of misogyny, or sexism, in language itself.

Dr. Jirran finds himself with more scholarly company as time goes on. For one example, scholars are looking at the vocabulary used to express the political ideology of the French

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

Revolution.⁴² For another example, scholars are examining court cases as legitimate expressions of the public mood.⁴³

In his concern for the limitations languages place upon thought, Dr. Jirran is particularly sensitive to the history of the illiterate. One oral historian expressed the following, "We realized that . . . historians are handicapped by concepts of little use in reaching illiterates. We use abstract and noncontextual jargon that makes communication difficult."⁴⁴ The effort to overcome sexism in this classroom and in the United States has reverberations as the unisex United States military patrol the world.

K. Political Rights

Though women fought to participate in the French Revolution, their gains were few. The discourse of the Enlightenment, from which the French Revolution arose, was decidedly masculine and sexist. Women belonged in the private, rather than the public, spheres of life.

During the Old Regime, women had some public power at court and in the salons. With the Revolution, they were confined to the home. This public power was no numerical big deal, involving about thirty out of a possible thirteen million women.

French women only received the vote after the Second World War. What happened?

Was this because republicanism was antifeminist or because it was anticlerical and believed that votes for women would produce a strong clerical party? Or was it because Rousseau's compelling arguments for the specialness of womanhood, the naturalness of difference, of female sensibility rather than equal rationality, even convinced many women so that they did not push as hard as other Western women against the constraints?⁴⁵

What role the state had in the social history of the U. S. has too long been downplayed in favor of the role of the state in such European enterprises as the First World War, the Bolshevik revolution, the rise of Hitler, the Second World War, and, above all, the Holocaust. The state even played an important role in the economic development of the U. S., in the role the state held least. It is simply a myth that "we sprang, by immaculate conception, from the loins of Adam Smith."⁴⁶ Adam Smith was the English economist who taught that the best government was the least government. He implied that the interrelationship between the role of the state and the role of others hides a better explanation than now available for the history of feminism.

Even before the First World War, some feminist thought was arguing for a feminized Marxism, still leaving motherhood as the center of the female experience. For important feminists, the First World War meant that the last obstacles to the full expression of male virile instincts were being swept away as were the obstacles to the full realization of the female drive to self sacrifice. War, therefore, was good. Feminist thought no longer regards either motherhood or war as unequivocal goods.⁴⁷

Some related research,⁴⁸ nevertheless, is going on. If the whole society is mad, then is the mad person in that society in possession of the only sanity available? That is a question meriting

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

analysis. The images of women, Blacks, and Jews in the late Nineteenth and the early Twentieth Century Europe had been linked with ideas about sexual perversity and mental illness.

Women became identified with Blacks and Jews with women to form a generalized alienated conception of the Other, that is God. Research suggested that a stylized representation of the Other is essentially an externalization of the bad self, undertaken in an effort to maintain control over the world.⁴⁹ In other words, political rights have extended to treating God like a figment of the imagination. This approach to reality distorts the political balance required for keeping planet Earth environmentally sound.

The notion of the state as the enemy of the environment and human rights is illustrated in several articles in the February 2001 *American Historical Review*: "Gridded Lives: Why Kazakhstan and Montana Are Nearly the Same Place,"⁵⁰ "Green Havoc': Panama Disease, Environmental Change, and Labor Process in the Central American Banana Industry,"⁵¹ and "Smelling like a Market."⁵² Three essays are headed *Review Essays: Seeing Like a State*.⁵³

L. Definitions

The meaning of socialism can get quite complex. Some very simple definitions may help clarify the issues.

- Imperialism: a public policy by which one nation controls another.
- Fascism: that public policy best exemplified by EI Supremo in Italy, particularly in matters economic.--You have two cows. You keep the cows and give the government the milk. The government sells part of the milk back to you.⁵⁴
- Nationalism: that psychological state by which people experience mutual, and excluding, political identification. Everyone owns all the cows.
- Socialism: that ideology by which the right of eminent domain becomes paramount. Eminent domain is the prerogative of the state to usurp private property for the public good, e.g. when constructing a highway.--You have two cows. You give your neighbor one.
- New Dealism: --You have two cows. The government shoots one of the cows, milks the other and pours half of the milk down the drain.
- Nazism: that public policy exercised by Hitler, particularly in social matters.--You have two cows. The government shoots you and takes the cows.
- Communism: that form of socialism which is atheistic.--You have two cows. The government takes the cows and gives you the milk.
- Capitalism: that economic system characterized by private property and lack of government intervention into private enterprise.--You have two cows. You sell one and buy a bull.
- Totalitarianism: that practice of government which exercises authority over all individual rights, e.g. Nazism, Fascism, and Communism.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

- Liberalism: that political philosophy which seeks moderate change away from the status quo.
- Conservatism: that political philosophy which accepts only slow change away from the historical status quo.
- Reaction: that political philosophy which accepts change only directed at restoring a bygone status quo.
- Radicalism: that political philosophy which seeks immoderate change away from the status quo.
- Institutions: -those habits, practices, customs, and laws that govern the interactions of people in society as they collaborate to produce and allocate both material and nonmaterial goods.⁵⁵
- Morals: -the criteria on the basis of which institutions are generated, noting that the generation of these criteria rest upon human nature.⁵⁶

M. Conclusion

If history is about anything, history is about social changes. There is some very complicated rationale, then, for the length.⁵⁷

The incompatible inseparables at work here are those between the supremacy of the territorial state as the "natural" unit of human society and the claim of the church to govern human souls. The sections on Civil, Economic, Linguistic, and Political Rights reach to the core of what it means to be human. The deeper issue is, are humans creatures of the state only or are humans creatures of God, somehow beyond the reach of the state? Thinking about these issues, students are to evaluate international relations according to a criteria of the chronology, personalities, places, and degrees of certitude warranted. Students are reminded to read, study, think, and prepare a comment.

Comments on the Seventh Edition of Chambers, pages 799-822

In the opinion of the professor, Chambers is the most scholarly textbook on the market. Chambers well represents mainstream thinking in the history profession. The professor, however, disagrees in many significant ways with mainstream thinking. Some of these disagreements are set forth above and others in the following comments.

Page Column

Paragraph

Line

0801 box "...fundamental law..."

0804 box "...fundamental law..."

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

Fundamental law is mentioned in Topic O9 Enlightenment at F. Revolution.

0808 1 2 29-33 "...`utopian socialists'...Karl Marx..."

Chambers seems to distance himself from classifying Karl Marx as a utopian socialist. Dr. Jirran regards such classification as essential for understanding Marx.

0811 2 3 13-14 "...eventual emancipation of Russian serfs in the 1860s..."

Obfuscates the point that the Russians emancipated serfs in 1861 as properly noted in the caption on page 862, before the United States emancipated slaves in 1863.

0815-0816 *passim* Chambers is inconsistent between treating the middle class as a single unity or as a general term for many classes.

Dr. Jirran regards *the middle class* as a general term referring to many middle classes. There is a big difference between a large business owner and a small shopkeeper, both of whom belong to the middle classes.

0816 2 5 6-7 "...the humble potato, not common on the continent before 1750..."

Dr. Jirran is unsure whether this statement by Chambers contradicts 101 Lecture 35 Exploration, F. Trade (continued) 3. The Potato b. In Its Effects 1.) The Virtue. Dr. Jirran maintains that In Europe, maize (corn) and potatoes became significant only after 1650.

0820 footnote 6 The cholera bacillus was finally identified by Robert Koch in 1883.

In Topic 07 Energy, E. Ramifications, Dr. Jirran "By the 1880s bacteriologists had isolated and identified the specific causative agents of cholera" from earlier in the lecture in juxtaposition with this footnote. Dr. Jirran does not know whether the two statements can be reconciled.

0820 1 1 9-10 "...requiring thousands of educated and well-to-do men to visit the poor regularly..."

versus

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

0821 1 1 8-9 "...lower-class neighbor whose quarters they [doctors and inspectors] had never visited before."

It might be that Chambers is referring to a difference between Catholics and Protestants or non-Catholics, but Dr. Jirran is unsure.

Footnotes

¹ The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia, eds. Judith S. Levey, Agnes Greenhall, with the Staff of The Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), p. 416.

² These comments draw heavily from Emmet Larkin, review of Desmond Bowen, The Protestant Crusade in Ireland, 1800-70, in The Catholic Historical Review, Vol. XLXV, No. 4 (October, 1979), pp. 648-650. In the sixth edition, Chambers covers similar material on pages 864-865.

³ Fernand Braudel, Civilization and Capitalism, 15th--18th Century, volume 1: The Structures of Everyday Life: The Limits of the Possible, trans. Sian Reynolds (New York, 1981), 138 and ? Abel, Agrarkrisen und Agrarkonjunktur, 138, as cited by John Komlos, "Research Note: Stature and Nutrition in the Habsburg Monarchy: The Standard of Living and Economic Development in the Eighteenth Century," The American Historical Review, 90 (December, 1985): 1153, footnote 25.

⁴ Documentation misplaced, January 15, 1989

⁵ Oliver MacDonagh, The Hereditary Bondsman: Daniel O'Connell, 1775-1829, page 53 as cited in the review by Desmond Bowen, The American Historical Review, Vol. 94, No. 4 (October 1989), page 1105.

⁶ See Ira V. Brown, review of John R. McKivigan, The War against Proslavery Religion: Abolitionism and the Northern Churches, 1830-1865, The American Historical Review, 90 (February 1985): 221.

⁷ Hasia R. Diner, review of Janet A. Nolan, Ourselves Alone: Women's Emigration from Ireland, 1885-1920 in The Journal of American History, Vol. 77, No. 4 (March 1991), pages 1382-1383.

⁸ Thomas P. Power, review of Robert James Scally, The End of Hidden Ireland: Rebellion, Famine, and Emigration, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 102, No. 3 (June 1998), page

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

- ⁹ W. J. Rorabaugh, review of Jean-Charles Sournia, A History of Alcoholism, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 4 (October 1991), pages 1159-1160.
- ¹⁰ W. J. Rorabaugh, review of Jean-Charles Sournia, A History of Alcoholism, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 4 (October 1991), pages 1159-1160.
- ¹¹ W. J. Rorabaugh, review of Jean-Charles Sournia, A History of Alcoholism, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 4 (October 1991), pages 1159-1160.
- ¹² W. J. Rorabaugh, review of Jean-Charles Sournia, A History of Alcoholism, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 4 (October 1991), pages 1160.
- ¹³ Steven Hahn, "Class and State in Postemancipation Societies: Southern Planters in Comparative Perspective," The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 1 (February 1990), page 84.
- ¹⁴ Paula Baker, "The Domestication of Politics: Women and American Political Society, 1780-1920," AHR, Vol. ?, No. ? (June 1984), p. 624
- ¹⁵ Marie Marmo Mullaney, review of Jane Rendall, The Origins of Modern Feminism: Women in Britain, France, and the United States, 1780-1860 in The American Historical Review, 91 (December 1986): 1163.
- ¹⁶ Mary Lynn McDougall, review of Barbara Taylor, Eve and the New Jerusalem: Socialism and Feminism in the Nineteenth Century, The American Historical Review, 89 (February, 1984): 121.
- ¹⁷ Sharon Wells found the material in Trevor Lloyd, Suffragettes International, pp. 11, 12 and 14; Richard J. Evans, The Feminists, p. 64; Sheila Rowbotham, Women, Resistance, and Revolution, p. 130. See page 804 in the seventh edition of Chambers.
- ¹⁸ Alice G. Vines, review of Philippa Levine, Victorian Feminism, 1850-1900 in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 3 (June 1991), page 874.
- ¹⁹ Philippa Levine, Victorian Feminism, 1850-1900, page 105 as cited in the review by Alice G. Vines in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 3 (June 1991), page 874.
- ²⁰ Blanche Linden-Ward, review of Louis P. Masur, Rites of Execution: Capital Punishment and the Transformation of American Culture, 1776-1865, The Journal of American History, Vol. 77, No. 1 (June 1990), page 874. Also see Thomas Nelson Community College Learning Resources Center Library number: H V6021.J66 1986 David Arthur Jones, History of Criminology: A Philosophical Perspective (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1986).

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

- ²¹ Irene D. Neu, review of Julie A. Matthaei, An Economic History of Women in America: Women's Work, the Sexual Division of Labor, and the Development of Capitalism, The American Historical Review, 71 (February, 1984): 215-216.
- ²² Gerda Lerner review of Suzanne Lebsock, The Free Women of Petersburg: Status and Culture in a Southern Town, 1784-1860, The American Historical Review, 90 (February 1985): 218-219.
- ²³ Maurine Weiner Greenwald, review of Alice Kessler-Harris, Out to Work: A History of Wage-Earning Women in the United States, The American Historical Review, 89 (February, 1984): 193.
- ²⁴ Marjorie Murphy, "Review Article, What Women Have Wrought," The American Historical Review, 93 (June 1988): 653.
- ²⁵ Jean H. Quataert, review of Barbara Franzoi, At the Very Least She Pays the Rent: Women and German Industrialization, 1871-1914, in The American Historical Review, 92 (February 1987): 156.
- ²⁶ Jean H. Quataert, review of Barbara Franzoi, At the Very Least She Pays the Rent: Women and German Industrialization, 1871-1914, in The American Historical Review, 92 (February 1987): 156.
- ²⁷ Bonnie G. Smith, "The Contribution of Women to Modern Historiography in Great Britain, France, and the United States, 1750-1940," The American Historical Review, 89 (June 1984): 715.
- ²⁸ Mary Poovey, review of Desley Deacon, Managing Gender: The State, the New Middle Class, and Women Workers, 1830-1930, in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 5 (December 1991), pages 1598-1599.
- ²⁹ Judith S. Levey and Agnes Greenhall, editors, The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia, (New York: Avon Books, 1983), page 475.
- ³⁰ Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986). Dr. Jirran finished reading this book in March 1992, as part of the Tidewater Historians reading.
- ³¹ Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 20.
- ³² Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 20.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

- ³³ Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 21.
- ³⁴ Ruth Milkman, Gender at Work: The Dynamics of Job Segregation by Sex during World War II as cited in Marjorie Murphy, "Review Article, 'What women have wrought.'" The American Historical Review, 93 (June 1988): 656.
- ³⁵ Susan Porter Bernson, Counter Cultures: Saleswomen, Managers, and Customers in American Department Stores, 1890-1940 as reviewed by Marjorie Murphy, "Review Article, 'What women have wrought.'" The American Historical Review, 93 (June 1988): 658.
- ³⁶ Susan Porter Bernson, Counter Cultures: Saleswomen, Managers, and Customers in American Department Stores, 1890-1940 as reviewed by Marjorie Murphy, "Review Article, 'What women have wrought.'" The American Historical Review, 93 (June 1988): 658.
- ³⁷ Susan Porter Bernson, Counter Cultures: Saleswomen, Managers, and Customers in American Department Stores, 1890-1940 as reviewed by Marjorie Murphy, "Review Article, 'What women have wrought.'" The American Historical Review, 93 (June 1988): 662. Computer technology permits repeating the whole footnote with less inconvenience than an abbreviation. Since documenting with too much information is relatively easy to correct, the whole footnote is offered each time. The advantages are that the reader does not have to hunt for the full documentation and that the order in which material appears does not have to be constantly rechecked to ensure that the full documentation always appears before any abbreviation of that documentation as the lecture becomes edited over and over again. This change in documentation practice began in 1988.
- ³⁸ Sheila M. Rothman, review of Barbara J. Harris, Beyond Her Sphere: Women and the Professions in American History in AHR, Vol. 85, No. 1 (February 1980), p. 198.
- ³⁹ Hilda L. Smith, review of Margaret W. Ferguson et al., editors, Rewriting the Renaissance: The Discourses of Sexual Difference in Early Modern Europe in The American Historical Review, 93 (April 1988): 408.
- ⁴⁰ Richard Halperin as cited in Hilda L. Smith, review of Margaret W. Ferguson et al., editors, Rewriting the Renaissance: The Discourses of Sexual Difference in Early Modern Europe page 97 in The American Historical Review, 93 (April 1988): 408.
- ⁴¹ Derrida and Mary Daly as cited in Hilda L. Smith, review of Margaret W. Ferguson et al., editors, Rewriting the Renaissance: The Discourses of Sexual Difference in Early Modern Europe in The American Historical Review, 93 (April 1988): 408.
- ⁴² Sarah Maza, "Domestic Melodrama as Political Ideology: The Case of the Comte de Sanios," The American Historical Review, Vol. 94, No. 5 (December 1989), page 1250.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

⁴³ Sarah Maza, "Domestic Melodrama as Political Ideology: The Case of the Comte de Sanios," The American Historical Review, Vol. 94, No. 5 (December 1989), page 1250.

⁴⁴ Mercedes Vilanova, "Anarchism, Political Participation, and Illiteracy in Barcelona between 1934 and 1936," The American Historical Review, Vol. 97, No. 1 (February 1992), page 111.

⁴⁵ Olwen Hufton, review of Joan B. Landes, Women and the Public Sphere in the Age of the French Revolution in The American Historical Review, Vol. 96, No. 2 (April 1991), page 528.

⁴⁶ Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., "The Evolution of the National Government as an Instrument for Attaining Social Rights," in Toward new Human Rights: The Social Policies of the Kennedy and Johnson Administrations, ed. David C. Warner (Austin, 1977), p. 14 as cited in William E; Leuchtenburg, "The Pertinence of Political History: Reflections on the Significance of the State in America," The Journal of American History, 73 (December 1986): 590, footnote 24.

⁴⁷ Richard J. Evans, review of Alfred G. Meyer, The Feminism and Socialism of Lily Braun, in AHR, Vol. 92, No. 1 (February 1987), pp. 156-157.

⁴⁸ Interested students may wish to consult Martha Vicinus, "Sexuality and Power: A Review of Current Work in the History of Sexuality (r. essay)," Feminist Stud., 8 (Spring 1982): 133-56. Dr. Jirran has not seen this. He thinks it ought to be available at Old Dominion University, where there is a strong feminist interest.

⁴⁹ Paul Robinson, review of Sander L. Gilman, Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness in AHR, Vol. 91, No. 3 (June 1986), p. 655-656.

⁵⁰ Kate Brown, "Gridded Lives: Why Kazakhstan and Montana Are Nearly the Same Place," The American Historical Review, Vol. 106, No. 1 (February 2001), pages 17-48.

⁵¹ Steve Marquardt, "'Green Havoc': Panama Disease, Environmental Change, and Labor Process in the Central American Banana Industry," The American Historical Review, Vol. 106, No. 1 (February 2001), pages 49-80.

⁵² Fernando Coronil, "Smelling like a Market," The American Historical Review, Vol. 106, No. 1 (February 2001), pages 81-105.

⁵³ Jane Caplan, "The State in the Field: Official Knowledge and Truant Practices," Morton Keller, "Looking at the State: An American Perspective," and Fernando Coronil, "Smelling like a Market," The American Historical Review, Vol. 106, No. 1 (February 2001), pages 107-113, 114-118, and 119-129 respectively.

102--17 Social Changes © January 6, 2002

Raymond J. Jirran

⁵⁴ Examples are taken from a newspaper clipping given to me by L. Henggler from the LAFB Flyer, 4 February, 1973. The examples are attributed to TSgt. David C. Rambert of the Beale AFB, Calif. NCO Academy; There are also similar unattributed descriptions of Communism, Socialism, Nazism, Fascism, New Dealism, and Capitalism in Bob Phillips, *The Best of the Good Clean Jokes* (Eugene, Oregon 97402: Harvest Publishers, 1989), page 142.

⁵⁵ James Chowning Davies, "Lincoln: The Saint and the Man," Presidential Studies Quarterly, Vol. XVII, No. 1 (Winter 1987), p. 78.

⁵⁶ James Chowning Davies, "Lincoln: The Saint and the Man," Presidential Studies Quarterly, Vol. XVII, No. 1 (Winter 1987), p. 78.

⁵⁷ On July 17, 2001 only four 102 lectures were longer: 08, 10, 34, and 40. Twenty-three 101 lectures were longer: 06, 07, 08, 10, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 23, 24, 25, 26, 28, 32, 33, 34, 35, 38, 40, and 41.