

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

A. *Introduction*

Under this topic, the student will study what the established Church did about the revolt. The course goal for studying this material is **to evaluate the impact of the Catholic Revival upon the history of Western civilization** according to a criteria of the people, places, and times involved and the degree of certitude warranted.

If art is the organization of materials, the Roman Catholic Church is among the most imposing masterpieces of history. Through nineteen centuries, each heavy with crisis, she has held her faithful together, following them with her ministrations to the ends of the earth, forming their minds, molding their morals, encouraging their fertility, solemnizing their marriages, consoling their bereavements, lifting their momentary lives into eternal drama, harvesting their gifts, surviving every heresy and revolt, and patiently building again every broken support of her power.¹

Within the framework of contemporary society, the nature of generic religious influence seems more significant than the nature of specific religious influence.

B. *Catholic-Protestant Similarities*

Both Catholics and Protestants at the time of Reformation had much more in common with each other than with their modern counterparts. Both held that: basic authority was outside of man; both the church and the state received their power from God rather than the people; man was meant for God; there should not be freedom of worship; Christ was still personally significant for life; the sacraments had meaning and salvation was important, for example, in the afterlife. Catholics and Protestants quarreled bitterly and fought hard, nevertheless. The quarrel began over the meaning and nature of purgatory.

Current research indicates that purgatory as a localized place between hell and heaven, meant for the ultimate expiation of sin, was only developed in the Twelfth Century. This research enhances the accepted view of the High Middle Ages, as a time both of humane optimism and of rapidly growing pretensions from Rome. The point is twofold: first, the religious issues of the reformation are, in fact, still present; second, scholars no longer regard the Middle Ages as the Dark Ages.² Petrarch (1304-1374), cited for pages 394, 395, 406, 411, and 434 in the seventh edition of Chambers, first named the period between the classical writers and the Renaissance as "dark ages."³

Another observation is even more to the point of enabling the student to evaluate the impact of the Catholic Revival on Western civilization. Scholastic thinkers of the time, such as the Jesuit, Francisco de Suarez (1548-1617),⁴ helped lay the foundations for an international law suitable to the young sovereign states and the wider world of the Sixteenth Century.⁵ Suarez rejected the divine right theories of kingship.⁶ Whatever sense of morals remains in Twentieth Century Western civilization track back, in one way or another, through the Catholic Revival.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

C. *The Catholic Revival*

The Catholic Revival began with a small group at Rome in the late Fifteenth Century. That group was supported abroad by such humanists as Erasmus (1466-1536) and Sir Thomas More (1478-1535). The Council of Trent, which began in 1545 and finally ended in 1563, after many delays, set the standards. In 1568 the revised Roman breviary became the sole standard for the daily offices or prayers of the Church. In 1588 the Sacred Congregation of Rites and Ceremonies was established to ensure the Church had not left its original mission, as the Protestants charged.⁷ By 1590, these gains were consolidated within the church. The new spirit breathing in the Church was shown by St. Charles Borromeo (1538-1584),⁸ for example, and others.

D. *Results*

In a world full of intellectual novelties and inflamed by religious passions, either casual lip service to Christianity or its easy repudiation became as difficult as the dogmatic conviction of the ability of Christian doctrine or reason alone to guide people in all things whatsoever. After the 1648 Peace of Westphalia, which ended the last European wars of religion, passions subsided. Without being directly challenged, theology was, thereby, dethroned from first place among the arts and sciences. The principle of truth gave way to the principle of politics. Politicians, for their part, avoided directly challenging the traditional rights of religion.

The upshot of these struggles of the Sixteenth and early Seventeenth Centuries was clearly contrary to the intention of almost all who took part in them. The struggles opened the door to worldliness and modern science. Yet the failure to construct a world-view commanding general agreement and the resultant tolerance was the great achievement of the age.

Neither the intellectual softness toward which the Italian Renaissance had tended to descend in the Fifteenth Century, nor the fierce dogmatism of the Reformers of the Sixteenth Century prevailed. The interaction of Renaissance and Reformation, by heightening the tensions between the incompatible inseparables at the core of European culture--namely, the Hellenic pagan and the Judeo-Christian heritages, increased the variety, multiplied the potentialities, and raised the intellectual and moral energies of Europe to new height. The principles of truth continued to survive within a politically volatile Western context.

E. *Conclusion*

In this lesson, the student has seen Catholic-Protestant similarities and the results of the conflict. The student has seen how the reformers themselves begot the results they themselves did not desire. The student is better able to evaluate the impact of Catholicism upon the history of Western civilization. Students are reminded to read. Students are also reminded to prepare a comment.

Supplement

F. *Introduction*

There are a lot of variances within Western civilization. One purpose of these supplements is to find a match between student interests and the interests of the professor, which lie outside of, but

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

intersect with, the mainstream of academic thinking. The first part of the supplement for this lecture involves a general consideration of the secular manner in which the material is generally presented. The second part of the supplement touches upon a consideration of the legitimacy of private interpretation of the Bible and a little bit on sports history. But, before that, a word on Ecumenism and the Jesuits is in order.

G. Ecumenism

The Catholic-Protestant contest can be brought more up to date. Contemporary U.S. Protestantism can be classified into evangelical and ecumenical. The evangelical posture presents a united front against perceived Catholic threats to liberal civilization. A key post-Civil War objective was to keep tax funds away from Catholic schools.⁹ The ecumenical posture is willing to work with Catholics. The matter of tax-credits for students attending private schools is presently supported by the Republicans and rejected by the Democrats. The mixture of politics, truth, and religion continues to stir the understanding of what Western civilization means.

H. Jesuits

1. Domestic Missions

There is room for a word on the Jesuits, a term the seventh edition of Chambers on page , column 1, 6th last line mentions without comment . "Jesuit" was originally a derogatory term, like "Yankee," used to describe the Society of Jesus. A Jesuit signs his name with an ", S.J." after it. The Jesuits are regarded as the most learned order in the U. S. Most Catholic colleges are run by Jesuits, including such places as Xavier, Georgetown, and Boston College. The two best known Catholic universities, Notre Dame and The Catholic University of America, however, are not Jesuit-run.

The Jesuits were founded in 1540 by Saint Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556). While convalescing from a leg injury in the military, Ignatius got religion. He went to Paris and, with the little children, learned Latin there, in order to become a priest. He conceived of his order along military terms, in service of the pope, dedicated to leadership.

It can be argued and the professor has experienced Jesuit spirituality which finds beauty in the world and promise in human nature. This is a pre-Ignatian Renaissance attitude which the Protestant Revolt changed. This is the attitude of the Jesuits within themselves. Chambers recognizes this internal attitude on page 459, column 1, lines 7-8. "The Christian humanists he encountered convinced Loyola of the tremendous power of education." The scholar on these matters, John W. O'Malley, S.J., wrote, "They had an altogether special relationship to Renaissance Humanism."¹⁰ This is a power emanating from truth in Western civilization determining politics. Externally, the Jesuits are more known for defending the papacy, defending the hierarchy, and supporting the Council of Trent., all of which undid the earlier Catholic humanism.¹¹ O'Malley expresses amazement, writing, "I have even heard the Jesuits described as essentially agents for the implementation of Trent."¹² Jesuits were much more than that. The Jesuit approach preferred conciliation by way of mediation, rather than confrontational.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

Scholars studying the psychology of Ignatius regard his transformation as a development of identity, rather than the destruction of one identity for another. Jerome Nadal, S.J., one of the original "seven friends of the Lord," said that Jesuits "are not monks. . . . The world is our house."¹³ The professor regards Western civilization as developing in a similar manner, developing identity, rather than destroying one identity in favor of another.

Ignatius has been oversimplified as the "champion of the Counter-Reformation" or as "simply anti-Luther." Ignatius was militant without being a professional soldier. For those familiar with the life of the Saint, it may come as a surprise that Ignatius was "never a professional soldier."¹⁴

Ignatius was focused on both domestic and foreign missions. The Jesuits are not usually thought of as a missionary order, but, in fact, they were and are. Saint Francis Xavier (1506-1552) was a contemporary of Ignatius. Ignatius used to pester Xavier with the following question, "What does it profit a man to gain the world and suffer the loss of his soul?" This haunting question, in all of its complexity, continues to echo down the ages.

2. Foreign Missions

The reason for this section on the Jesuit missions, has less to do with the concern for the Catholic Reformation than with concern for what the Commonwealth of Virginia wants in her courses. The Commonwealth wants courses offered within a global context. For that purpose, one Matteo (mat aye' oh)¹⁵ Ricci (ree' chi)¹⁶, S.J. (1552-1610) is more important than Xavier. Xavier is mentioned in the seventh edition of Chambers on page 460.¹⁷ Ricci is not indexed.

As best as the professor can tell, no one has yet nominated Matteo Ricci for sainthood. Matteo Ricci told the church officials that when going into a place like China, European customs got in the way of Christian evangelization. Matteo Ricci unsuccessfully tried to get the papacy to honor legitimate Chinese scholarship.

The pope who gets the blame for suppressing the Jesuits' experiment with Chinese rites, killing the infant Chinese church, is Pope Clement XI (1700-1721). Clement is judged as "the saintliest" as well as "the worst pope of the century."¹⁸ The popes from Clement XI to Leo XII (1823-1829) did not grasp the truth of cultural changes, a truth which the laity did grasp. The papacy was still struggling with the Catholic Revival where the laity saw the need to grapple with rising modernism.

To get a sense of what is happening, Matteo Ricci wrote a missionary classic for introducing Christianity into China. Matteo Ricci wrote in 1603 and his work was first translated in 1985. This seems to be a case of church and state, i.e. the Catholic Church and Virginia, moving through ethnocentrism together.¹⁹

Matteo Ricci was interested in finding Chinese patterns of thought and categories, through which to explain the Catholic religion. An analogous approach still makes sense for explaining Virginia businesses to the Orient. One sells in the language of the buyer and one buys in the language of the seller. In other words, in order to sell Virginia goods in Japan, Virginians need to learn Japanese.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

Ricci critically evaluated the main systems of Chinese thought, namely Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism, through Renaissance scholastic philosophy. Ricci thought that the best match for Christianity was in Confucianism. Confucianism is a fundamentally secular approach to reality.

Ricci found no Chinese word equivalent to the Latin "Deus" or the English "God." Ricci identified the Christian "God/Deus" with the Chinese "Heaven/Sovereign on High." There were also problems communicating Western notions of immortality, divine life, the human soul, the meaning of suffering and death.

Missionaries tried to use Western technology to interest Chinese in Western ideology. The Chinese responded from the beginning until now by accepting Western practical technology without accepting Western ideology.²⁰ The professor maintains that that is because Western commitment to the truth in the face of politics has not been placed first and foremost. The professor wonders whether faith in the Creator is required to set up that value system, whereby the political power will not quash the power of truth, through inquisition, censorship, and calls for loyalty oaths.

Gunpowder illustrates and explains the practicality issue. The Chinese invented gunpowder in the Tenth Century. In the thirteenth Century the Mongols brought gunpowder to Europe. By the early Sixteenth Century the Chinese still maintained superiority in the technology of gunpowder, but the Europeans made better use of gunpowder in weaponry. By the "1620s Chinese workers were casting cannon in Macao under the direction of Portuguese gun founders, whose work was already in demand throughout colonial Asia."²¹

The professor is bothered by the Jesuit reaction to an inquiry by the emperor concerning the techniques required for casting artillery. The Jesuits denied any such knowledge in 1772. Shortly thereafter, however, a Jesuit missionary went to the battlefield specifically to advise on casting and using artillery. The issue was truth versus politics. The professor wonders whether Western civilization would have been ahead had the Jesuits given the real reason they "knew nothing." Superiors in Rome were chastising the Jesuits in China for "teaching the infidel the art of war" by developing a plan for the fortification of Beijing.²²

Since memory is such a big part of learning history, here is an almost unrelated gift for the student from Father Ricci on how to remember. Ricci had an interest in mnemonic devices which were then reaching their European apogee. The technique was to use vivid spatial ordering, something known as "the memory palace," to expand the ability to commit information to memory.²³

Four memory images are placed, each in a corner, in an imaginary entry-room to a memory palace. Four more Biblical images are added. For this course, perhaps, a pentagon for the five inseparable incompatibles would work: 1. church versus state; 2. faith versus reason; 3. symbol versus real; 4. violence versus and law; 5. Latin versus the vernacular. As time goes on, this idea may be developed further, depending on student reception.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

I. *Carmelites*

What were the Carmelites doing during the Catholic Reformation? Just as one might suspect, the Carmelites were catching hell from a female Saint, Teresa of Avila (1515-1582). The seventh edition of Chambers depicts Teresa on pages 455-456, 534, 557, 564, 564.²⁴ Although Chambers inconsistently spelled her name with an "h" at Plate 35, in all of the first five editions, the more respected sources and Chambers elsewhere spelled Teresa as it is here. Evidently Chambers lacked editorial control over the captions for the plates in the first five editions.²⁵

Teresa truly "developed a gift for making men give her the orders that she wanted to obey...."²⁶ Modern scholars turn around and have some fun at the expense of Teresa. In the Sixteenth Century, sexual relations between nuns and confessors were common enough. When Teresa describes herself as affectionate and having an intense sense of sin that, to modern scholars, means that she must have done something wrong. Such modern scholars miss the point that an intense sense of sin belongs to saints, not sinners. The secular sense of history predominates the history profession.

J. *Sister Formation*

As a Thomist, the Professor values the neo-scholastic movement following World War II. The Professor regards this movement as the implementation of truth determining politics within ecclesial politics. Sister formation makes the tie.

Within this context, the distinction between a nun and a sister is important. *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism* makes the distinction as follows:

Nun, in the strict sense, women in religious orders who take solemn vows of poverty, chastity, and obedience. Nuns observe the papal cloister and live a life of silence, contemplation, and prayer. Choir nuns chant the Divine Office daily. Vatican II (1962-1965) called for modifying the cloister, eliminating outmoded customs, and modifying the habit.

The word "nun" is also popularly used for women in religious congregations who take simple vows and who do not observe the cloister. It is also used as a synonym for "sister." See *also* religious life; sisters, congregations of.²⁷

This section is about sisters, not nuns. This section is about the tension in the Catholic Church in the United States between the ideal and the real, between a renaissance curriculum and a philosophical medieval synthesis, among other things.²⁸ There is a development of understanding at work throughout the Twentieth Century having an impact on higher education and, thereby, this very presentation of the Catholic Revival.

The place to begin is with the 1917 Code of Canon (or church) Law. This was the first revision since the time of Saint Raymond of Penafort in the Thirteenth Century. The 1917 Code took the scholastic approach that the Church was a Perfect Society in opposition to the world, rather than a

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

Mystical Body engaged with the world. The vows of poverty, chastity, and obedience came down to the vow of obedience in the final analysis.²⁹

In 1940 Sister Bertrande Meyers wrote a dissertation on a plan for Sister education based on "a controlling, integrating aim." By 1946 the magazine *Integrity* was advocating "a new synthesis of religion and life." In 1949 The Catholic University of America hosted a workshop titled, "Integration in Catholic Colleges and Universities." The Professor doubts very much that The Catholic University had in mind racial integration. In 1951 the title was clearer, "Theology, Philosophy and History as Integrating Disciplines in the Catholic College of Liberal Arts." At these workshops integration was defined as "the harmonious cooperation of forces resulting in well-coordinated actions which lead to the attainment of hierarchically ordered ends."³⁰ There was a long way to go.

With the advent of the 1950s, sisters needed to become more professional. State laws required it in education and nursing, the papacy encouraged it, and the sisters themselves wanted it. A small committee in the college section of the National Catholic Educational Association began meeting in 1952 to think through how to go about upgrading within the context of current secular developments. In 1954 they set off with the Sister Formation Conference which changed its name in 1976 to the Religious Formation Conference.³¹

The sisters began with scholastic deductive reasoning, beginning with first principles and working toward life as lived, actual experience.. Then the sisters had to face the reality of the difference between the ideal and the real. The sisters began to think more inductively, beginning with their experience and working back toward the first principles from which those experiences grew. Sisters began to think of themselves less as a Perfect Society and more as part of the Mystical Body of Christ.³²

By 1967 Sister Audrey Kopp, S.F.B., could write an article titled, "The Renewed Nuns: Collegial Christians." The real was portrayed as the "Split-Level Bureaucratized Convent," meaning that the vow of obedience was being abused. The life of the Sisters was set forth as exemplary of the struggles of the Church itself.³³

To get ahead of the story, without the article at hand, what happened next was not good. In their efforts to become more professional, the sisters began by insisting on a balance between prayer and , the Professor is at a loss for how to express it, social action. When the Professor asked his students how many came to college to learn about God, no one did that. The Professor insists that learning any truth is learning about God in the only way that God can be learned about, indirectly. For this reason the Professor has the above problem expressing his thought. The Professor thinks life itself should be a prayer, an act of worship, one life, and an integrated whole. That is not what happens. Time needs to be set aside for prayer, in the ordinary sense of focused prayer. As that focus was lost, sisters left their convents and new vocations became rarer.

By the end of the 1960s the Sisters had moved from the concept of a Perfect Society to that of the Mystical Body of Christ, to the People of God. The former Neo-Scholastic hierarchy had crumbled. Their vision was of a Church more decentralized and less hierarchic than before.³⁴

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

K. *Secularism*

1. Throughout Europe

The following comments arise out of interaction with Winter 1987 students. Their basic inquiry concerned the place and development of religion, from 1500 to 1700. These notes are based on an undocumented sense of what happened. Willingness to commit a sense of what happened to writing is based on a book review in the December 1986, The American Historical Review, pages 1213-1214, on the Damians Affair. Robert-Francois Damians tried to assassinate Louis XV in 1757.

New scholarship is drawing the origins of the French Revolution into religious foundations. If religion can survive the French Revolution as more than an outdated anachronism, then the student inquiries become particularly pertinent and the response all the more valuable. The approach begins with the beginning of Christianity.

The Lord's Supper, Communion, or, as the professor prefers, the Eucharist, began with the Last Supper. Christians 'did this in remembrance of him' for a thousand years before they effectively began to reflect on the philosophic Aristotelian ramifications of what they were doing. In the mid-Thirteenth Century, Saint Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) completed the Aristotelian logic of Christianity.

Transubstantiation is a logical, technical, theological term describing the transition between the bread and wine before and after the Eucharistic consecration. The general population came to accept such an abstract explanation of the repetition of the Lord's Supper in reaction to the Protestant revolt, by way of the Council of Trent. Other Christian dogma developed in a similar historical manner.

Before the time of Saint Bonaventure (ca. 1217-1274), after whom the Franciscan New York Saint Bonaventure University is named, it was customary to affirm Eucharistic conversion and to deny both the annihilation of the bread and wine in the sacrament and consubstantiation. To the contrary, Duns Scotus, another Franciscan, argued that it was not philosophically impossible for Jesus to be in two places, in the same physical manner, at once. Aquinas, whom the professor follows, thought that it was.³⁵ John Duns Scotus (1265?-1308)³⁶ is indexed in the seventh edition of Chambers on pages 285-286.³⁷ The student will remember that Luther accepted consubstantiation.

Baptism aside, the Eucharist, as one of the seven sacraments came first. Then, as one of the ramifications of those sacraments, came the notion of Purgatory. Purgatory may have had its doctrinal beginnings in Mohammed (ca. 570-632 AD), who taught that his followers dying on the jihad would go straight to heaven. Not to be outdone, the Christians taught that the crusaders, dying for their cause, would also go straight to heaven. Such limits on who would go straight to heaven seemed unfair to people who were unable to go on a crusade, but who were devoted, nonetheless, e.g., the lady left behind in her chastity belt. The notion of indulgences for pious

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

acts other than going on a crusade, was thus developed. The place from which indulgences protected the faithful in the afterlife was Purgatory.

2. In England

The skepticism of Chambers and academia toward God forces an interpretation and selection upon the facts which the students questioned. Just as the understanding of Christianity developed over time relative to such dogmas as the Eucharist and Purgatory, so did that same understanding develop with regard to changing economic circumstances. Scholarly interest in the Seventeenth Century English revolt concentrated on the relationship between economics and politics. The point was that the adaptability of English government was the source of English pre-eminence in modern times.

The problem with such a twist upon the facts was that Cromwell and the Puritans were consciously and primarily expressing a religious, rather than either a political or economic commitment. The Protestant tradition from which the Puritans operated traced itself back to the simplicity of Geneva and John Calvin (1509-1564). The Puritans were resisting, first of all, papal pomposity.

The Puritan struggle within England can be better understood as the adaptation of the Christian Commitment to the ongoing Commercial Revolution and to the Industrial Revolution about to happen. This argument is relatively easy. To extend that argument to France is practically unthinkable in mainstream history.

3, In France

The French Revolution arose out of the Enlightenment and was decidedly anti-religious. And yet the Damiens Affair book review³⁸ takes the origins of the French Revolution into the issues dividing parlementaires, Jansenists and other opponents of royal policies, from supporters of absolutism. Jansenism was coined as a term in 1656, a century before the attempt to assassinate Louis XV.

The abstractions of the constitutional debates of the French revolution were linked to the Jansenist refusal of the sacraments controversy out of which the Damiens affair arose. Jansenists refused to receive the Eucharist as frequently as Catholics. The reason Jansenists gave was their own unworthiness. Upon hearing the sedition-inciting anti-crown rhetoric arguments then current in aristocratic households, this ne'er-do-well itinerant domestic servant, Damiens, turned into a would-be assassin. Damiens linked elite political concerns and popular expression of religious truth.

This linkage of the origins of the French Revolution with opposition to the crown in the later years of Louis XV, shows that there was a stream of protorevolutionary ideas and actions that owed little or nothing to the Enlightenment philosophes. The French Revolution is thus freed from a single anti-religious origin, stemming from those same Enlightenment philosophes. The context of scurrilous, seditious expressions of popular opposition to the crown extended in a continuum

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

back to the late Sixteenth Century. It really was not necessary to get rid of the Church to get rid of the King.

One point in the book review is particularly germane. "Typically, specialists in the last century of the Old Regime do not seek a context in earlier periods of French Constitutional struggle." This sentence lies at the basis of the sense that the selection of the pertinent facts and that the very interpretation of the French Revolution is twisted away from reality.

The logic of the Damiens Affair book review seems to maintain that Christianity was embracing the French Revolution all the while, going back for centuries. This seems logical, because nothing happens out of the blue. The way in which the English Revolution seems to be misinterpreted and the way in which the facts may have been selectively chosen to interpret the French Revolution suggests pause over contemporaneous mainstream scholarly presentations, with regard to both Revolutions.

4. In Italy

Part of what gets presented is determined by scholarly interests in the first place. While the title of this section is *In Italy* the meaning is decidedly different from *Throughout Europe*, *In England*, or *In France*. The first three titles characterize historical events. This title, to the contrary, characterizes historiography. Italy has been studied. Other places remain to be studied.

Karl Marx charged that religion was the opiate of the masses. What administrative tacks were used in the West to prevent the masses from utilizing truth to cause anarchy? How was discipline maintained? How did church and state mesh to determine what would be regarded as true?

Max Weber insisted, as does the professor, on the central role of religion for the development of Modern Europe. Michel Foucault went from the Council of Trent, to confessional-box discourses, to the suppression of the masses. Foucault also regarded clerical academic administration of the universities as a tool to suppress truth. In this way the Tridentine effort to establish regularity and order resulted in suppression of the masses and the distortion of truth.³⁹ Foucault is indexed for pages 1128, 1128n, 1129, 1146 in the seventh edition of Chambers; Weber for page 991.

Education was not used to liberate the people but to control the clergy under the supervision of the bishops. Priests were to turn the faithful away from private devotions toward regularized devotions such as Mass and yearly confession. The confessional was used to control potentially unorthodox devotion and simulated sanctity. Scholars make their case by focusing on, schools and university regulations among a myriad of other institutions. First Italy, then all of Early Modern Europe became an age of social disciplining.⁴⁰

The sense of social disciplining can be found in colonial Latin America. Native Americans wanted to believe in dreams and other superstitions. Native Spaniards had similar beliefs, for example the power of potions. The sacrament of Confession was used to bring those who followed such practices into conformity with what the church and state wanted. Race was an impediment to marriage.⁴¹

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

The case for an age of social disciplining is hard to make. There are two many revolutions to take into account.⁴² The professor regards the touchstone of Western civilization as the determination that truth should determine politics, rather than the other way around. Who, then, owns the truth? What place is there for private interpretation of what is true? Of the Bible?

L. Private Interpretation

Renaissance humanists took a different view of the Bible than did their earlier medieval counterparts. Rather than consider the Latin Vulgate translation of Jerome as sacred, they looked back to the original Greek. Rather than look for the meaning of Biblical passages in sacred theology, Renaissance scholars looked to carefully authenticated linguistic and historical context. This attitude has continued to the present.⁴³

Erasmus (1466-1536) exemplified Renaissance Biblical scholarship. The seventh edition of Chambers indexes Erasmus, Desiderius (humanist) on pages 435, 435-436 and Erasmus of Rotterdam on pages 420, 421. *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 474 writes, "**Erasmus, Desiderius**, also known as Erasmus of Rotterdam . . ." The professor wonders if Chambers has not erred indexing Erasmus twice.⁴⁴ The Biblical scholarship of Erasmus is written up on page 436.⁴⁵ The difference between present-day scholars and Erasmus is that Erasmus seriously intended his research to serve the cause of moral and religious renewal, whereas present-day scholars often do not care. Erasmus, nonetheless, criticized medieval exegetes, especially Thomas Aquinas, "for distorting the plain sense of scripture to support Church dogma."⁴⁶

What seems to make sense is that the Church gave the Bible its meaning, and, not the other way around, did the Bible give the Church her meaning. The early church councils convincingly followed this approach. Only with the Protestant Revolt was the right of the Church to give the Bible its meaning challenged by the right of the individual to a private interpretation of the Bible. Surprisingly, this historical reality has only recently been documented and traced.⁴⁷

M. Historical Anthropology

The very term "historical anthropology" only came into use in the late 1970s. Students really would not be much bothered with it here, except for the fact that David Herlihy paid attention to it in a [The Catholic Historical Review](#) book review. Besides being a co-author with Chambers, Herlihy is the past president of both the Catholic Historical Association and the American Historical Association.

Historical anthropology concentrates on particulars and details, rather than central patterns of human activity. Non-verbal forms of expression are important to historical anthropologists. For example, no saint at all was canonized between 1523 and 1588. Saint Teresa was trying to shape up the Carmelites during that very period. She died in 1582. The Council of Trent lasted from 1545 to 1563. This was a good time for the Catholic Church to remain quiet, while it tried to revive.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

Historical anthropology seems to be the discipline most suited for the periodization of history most appealing to the professor, periodization based on communication. Historical anthropology studies rituals, such as the Quakers refusing to doff their caps, even for the king. The French revolutionaries did away with such rituals. The professor wants to change the focus from cap doffing to the printing press (1455), to Galileo (1610), to Newton (1725), to Einstein (1910), to satellite communications (1990).

N. Sports

What do play and sports reveal about the human condition? Where might a comment about sports be appropriate in a course like this? Why not tug and force the material into the shoe of the Catholic Reformation, on the supposition that Catholics were more inclined to play around than Protestants?

Bowling is a good sport to examine because it dates from Stone Age artifacts. There is Egyptian evidence for bowling in 5200 B.C. As early as 50 B.C. the Romans enjoyed a form of lawn-bowling very similar to an Italian game still in use. The modern game of tenpins may have originated in central European monasteries and cathedrals as part of a religious ritual. Records dating from 300 AD attest to this probability. The idea was to hit the pin and, thus, knock over the devil.⁴⁸

By 1200 AD the ball was rolled down a single wooden board twelve to eighteen inches in width, placed in clay alleys. Relatively soon, all-weather indoor lanes were built. Martin Luther is credited with fixing the number of pins at nine and standardizing the rules of the game of ninepins. Luther built a bowling alley for his family next to his house.

Within a century, in 1626, Dutch settlers brought ninepins to Manhattan. Ninepins probably reached its peak of popularity, largely due to German immigrants, by 1840. The game of tenpins was developed to circumvent laws against ninepins.

For about twenty years various attempts were made to standardize bowling rules in the U. S. The American Bowling Congress was formed in 1895 to do just that. That was about the same time that the philosopher Nietzsche (1844-1900) was complaining that society had regimented its inhabitants into "human sand."

The Protestant revolt occurred because Catholics had not overly-regimented the faithful. The truths of Catholicism did leave room for political maneuvering. That intellectual room is important for people to realize their full potentials in all of their varieties. Democracy, should it enforce a tyranny of the majority, can stifle such politically incorrect insights. Nietzsche wanted a Western civilization in which individuation would not be submerged into straight-jackets of rules and regulations. Contrary to Catholicism, Nietzsche came from an atheistic base. By the late Nineteenth Century, religious truth was under considerable political pressure.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

O. Conclusion

The student has examined the Introduction, Catholic-Protestant Similarities, The Catholic Reformation, Results, and the Conclusion to the main lecture. In this supplement, the student has continued reading with the Introduction, Ecumenism, Jesuits, Carmelites, Secularism, Private Interpretation, Historical Anthropology, Sports, and this final Conclusion. The course goal for studying this material is to evaluate the impact of the Catholic Revival upon the history of Western civilization. This evaluation is to take place according to a criteria of the people, places, and times involved and the degrees of certitude warranted. The incompatible inseparables at work here are those between faith and reason, value and fact, morality and science, each claiming to be the path to truth. Western civilization distinguishes itself by valuing that that path to truth not be hindered by political interference. Students are reminded to prepare a comment.

Before advancing to Topic 35--Exploration the Professor recognizes that not one of the missionary activities of the period are even mentioned in any of the multiple decrees of the Council of Trent.⁴⁹ The Professor joins with mainstream historians in concern about the legitimacy and morality of such missionary enterprises. Remember the Professor himself studied for seven years after high school to be a Josephite Roman Catholic missionary in the Black apostate in the United States. He has never rejected the legitimacy of the Josephites.

Comments on the Seventh Edition of Chambers, pages 0452-0461.

In the opinion of the professor, Chambers is the most scholarly textbook on the market. Chambers well represents mainstream thinking in the history profession. The professor, however, disagrees in many significant ways with mainstream thinking. Some of these disagreements are set forth above and others in the following comments.

Page Column

Paragraph

Line

0452 1 2 4-5 ' . . . Catholic historians call it the Catholic Reformation . . . "
the Professor prefers the Catholic Revival. and the Protestant Revolt.

The scholar in the field, John W. O'Malley, S.J., likes Early Modern Catholicism.⁵⁰ The Professor regards that term as too neutral, as if there was nothing which needed to be revived. It was not the old Church sins which were revived, but a newly reinvigorated faith.

O'Malley is willing to acknowledge a "Thomistic revival" during his Early Modern Catholicism.⁵¹ The Professor regards the revival as not only Thomistic, but Church-wide, Catholic as well.

0452 2 2 1 ". . . no doubt. . . "

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

That depends upon when one historically starts the Catholic Church.
There were some pretty dim days in the First Century.

0452 2 3 8 "... spiritual authority. . ."

There is evidence that the issue is truth versus power, power, the result of authority. On page

442 1 3 6 ff. Luther translates the Bible.
447 2 1 1-4 "Melchiorites . . . gained political control ..."
451 1-2 "The king . . . had parliament agree . . ."
459 2 1531 "King Henry VII proclaims himself head ..."

0453 1 1 2 "... a Roman Inquisition . . ."

In the Index, at Inquisition, Chambers refers to Papal Inquisition and Spanish Inquisition. At Papal Inquisition, Chambers has Galileo and, 548-549 of Pope Gregory IX, 310, 312-313 techniques of, 312.

Page 453 is not indexed.

The Inquisition began with Pope Gregory IX in 1231. The Inquisition to which Chambers refers here, begun in 1542, is more generally known as *the* Roman Inquisition, not a Roman Inquisition.⁵²

The January 6, 2000 Topic 23--Mary at K. Marriage, mentions the Venetian Inquisition from the late 1570s through 1591.

There is a further section K. The Spanish Inquisition in the January 8, 2000 Topic--38 Spain lecture.

0453 2 2 7 "... the most illustrious College in history."

Chambers means the most illustrious College of Cardinals.

0454 2 1 11 "... equal place . . ."

The professor would prefer omitting the word *equal* to say, "the Bible is not the exclusive authority for the believer: Church tradition also holds a place in establishing religious truth."

0454 2 1 4th last". . . Christ's sacrifice is reenacted in every Mass."

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

The Professor would prefer *at*, rather than *in* every Mass. The difference is that the original sacrifice was bloody while the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass is unbloody.

0454 caption

"Titian"

The professor has a problem identifying "The Council of Trent, Ca 1564" as a work by Titian. The most complete works of Titian found by the professor, *The Complete Library of World Art: All the Paintings of Titian*, does not identify that picture.⁵³ On December 15, 1999 the professor e-mailed the editors at McGraw requesting help. On December 16 the professor received a reply indicating that the painting is only attributed to Titian and is located in the Louvre.

The professor immediately replied:

Thank you.

There is no qualification to *Titian* as it first appears in the caption. I read the caption to mean that the scene, not the painting somehow, was attributed to Titian.

Thank you for indicating that the painting is found at the Louvre.

What does *Giraudon/Art Resource* (as part of the caption) mean? That someone by the name of Giraudon made a copy which a company by the name of Art Resource then distributed?

Yes, I would like more information on that picture.

My concept of a pulpit, as the caption reads, ". . . one of their number address the assembly from the pulpit on the right," does not jibe with the depiction. It looks to me as if there might be two or three people in the pulpit and that the preacher may be in the choir below the pulpit. Or are there two pulpits? Or are there one pulpit and two choirs? Was the scene made up? Made up by Titian? Is this actually the way things appeared at Trent? Did Titian use one building to depict something which happened in another building? What is portended by the historical accuracy of this picture?

Thank you, again.

. . . *All the Paintings of Titian*, cited in the footnote sent to you, included attributions.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

To my very untrained eye, looking through all of the paintings of Titian, *The Council of Trent* does not look like something I might attribute to Titian.

I keep wondering whether there might be a misattribution here.

Other illustrations attributed to *Giraudon/Art Resource*, with ellipsis from the captions, are found at:

0008	the Sumerian hero Gilgamesh
0117	the ruthless tyrant Cornelius Sulla
0245	Investiture Scene
0284	Heloise and Abelard
0289	South Portal of St. Pierre, Moissac, ca. 1115-1135
0296	Count Geoffrey of Anjou
0297	Eleanor of Aquitaine Effigy
0397	<i>Raphael</i> Baldassare Castiglione
0404	<i>Leonardo da Vinci</i> Mona Lisa, ca. 1503-1505
0454	<i>Titian</i> The Council of Trent, ca 1564, mentioned above.
0485	Francis I and His Court, from the Manuscript of Antoine (This is the only place where, NY follows <i>Giraudon/Art Resource</i>)
0531	<i>Anonymous</i> The Seine from the Pont Neuf, ca. 1635
0545	<i>Peter Brueghel</i> The Alchemist, engraving
0580	<i>The Palace of Versailles in 1668</i>
0589	<i>P. D. Martin</i> Procession after Louis XV's Coronation
0617	<i>L. N. van Blarenberghe</i> The Battle of Fontenoy, 1745
0633	J. Vernet, "Construction of a Road."
0664	Voltaire returned triumphantly to Paris.
0669	"Allegory of the Revolution with a Portrait Medallion of J. J. Rousseau."
0672	painting of Mme. Geoffrin's Salon in 1755
0675	Queen Marie Antoinette
0678	<i>Jean-Baptiste Greuze</i> The Father's Curse
0706	October 1789 Parisian women
0710	The assault on the Tuileries
0725	General Bonaparte
0728	field of guillotines
0743	Emperor Napoleon I
0767	<i>Eugene Delacroix</i> Greece Expiring
0816	Dominique Ingres portrayed the entrepreneur Louis Bertrand
0839	emblems of revolution defeated in this painting by Ernest Meissonier.

Endnotes

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

¹Will Durant turns phrases so well, that I like to quote him verbatim. In The Story of Civilization: Vol. 4.: The Age of Faith: A History of Medieval Civilization from Constantine to Dante, p. 44.

²Review of Jacques Le Goff, La Naissance du Purgatoire, or The Birth of Purgatory, in The American Historical Review 87 (December 1982): 1374.

³ Kenneth ?? Gouwens, "Perceiving the Past ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 103, No. 1 (February 1998), page 78.

⁴ *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 1226.

⁵Another, less controversial review by Robert Bireley of A. D. Wright, The Counter-Reformation. Catholic Europe and the Non-Christian World, ?? A 88 (June 1983): 698, makes a similarly important point.

⁶ *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 1226

⁷ Gary Ianziti, review of Simon Ditchfield, *Liturgy, Sanctity and History in Tridentine Italy: Pietro Maria Campi and the Preservation of the Particular* in *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 103, No. 1 (February 1998), page 225.

⁸ *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 192.

⁹George Marsden, review of Philip D. Jordan, The Evangelical Alliance for the United States of America, 1847-1900: Ecumenism, Identity and the Religion of the Republic. Studies in American Religion, number 7.) The American Historical Review 89 (June 1984): 861; for further development see Thomas J. Shelley, "The Oregon School Case and the National Catholic Welfare Conference," The Catholic Historical Review 75 (July 1989): 439-457. The Oregon School Case was settled in 1925.

¹⁰ John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 189.

¹¹ Thomas V. Cohen, review of John W. O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, in *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 99, No. 5 (December 1994), page 1677.

¹² John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 188.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

¹³ Peter Kountz, "Ignatius of Loyola and a New Direction for the History of the Jesuits: Review Article [W. W. Meissner, S.J., *Ignatius of Loyola: The Psychology of a Saint*], *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 82, No. 3 (July 1996), page 469..

¹⁴ Donald P. Gavin, review of Candido de Dalmases, S.J. Translated by Jerome Aiszla, S.J., Ignatius of Loyola, Founder of the Jesuits. His Life and Work in The Catholic Historical Review 73 (July 1987): 594-595.

¹⁵ Correspondence with Fr. Robert J. Welsh, S.J., President, Saint Ignatius High School, September 12, 1990.

¹⁶ Correspondence with Fr. Robert J. Welsh, S.J., President, Saint Ignatius High School, September 12, 1990.

¹⁷ Xavier is mentioned in the fifth edition of Chambers on page 567; in the sixth on 418; in the seventh on 460.

¹⁸ Owen Chadwick, *The Popes and European Revolution* as quoted by the review by Charles H. O'Brien in *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 87, No. 4 (October 1982), pages 438-439.

¹⁹ Christopher Spalatin, S.J. of Sogang University, Seoul, Korea, review of Matteo Ricci, S.J. Translated by Douglas Lancashire and Peter Ku Kuo-chen, S.J. A Chinese-English Edition edited by Edward J. Malatesta, S.J. in The Catholic Historical Review 73 (October 1987): 618-619.

²⁰ Joanna Waley-Cohen, "China and Western Technology in the Late Eighteenth Century ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 98, No. 5 (December 1993), page 1527.

²¹ Joanna Waley-Cohen, "China and Western Technology in the Late Eighteenth Century ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 98, No. 5 (December 1993), page 1530-1531.

²² Joanna Waley-Cohen, "China and Western Technology in the Late Eighteenth Century ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 98, No. 5 (December 1993), page 1537.

²³ David E. Mungello, review of Jonathan D. Spence, The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci. (Elisabeth Sifton) in The American Historical Review, Vol. 93, No. 2 (April 1986), pages 444-445.

²⁴ The fourth edition of Chambers indexed Teresa, St., for pages 561 and 602, but not 580. The fifth edition of Chambers corresponds to the fourth edition of Chambers on page 644. The fifth edition of Chambers depicts Teresa on Plate 35 and on page 561 and 602. The sixth edition of Chambers depicts Teresa on page 517f and on pages 414, 415b, 488, and 510. The seventh edition of Chambers depicts Teresa on pages 455-456, 534, 557, 564, 564 Joanna Waley-Cohen, "China and Western Technology in the Late Eighteenth Century ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 98, No. 5 (December 1993), page 1527. Joanna Waley-Cohen, "China and Western

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

Technology in the Late Eighteenth Century ??," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 98, No. 5 (December 1993), page 1527.

²⁵Jodi Bilinkoff, review of Victoria Lincoln, *Teresa: A Woman. A Biography of Teresa of Avila*, in *The Catholic Historical Review* 73 (July 1987): 613-614. Also see Joachim Smet, O.Carm., *The Carmelites: A History of the Brothers of Our Lady of Mount Carmel: Ca. 1200 A.D. until the Council of Trent* (Rome: Carmelite Institute (Private Printing), 1975), and Joachim Smet, O.Carm., *The Carmelites: A History of the Brothers of Our Lady of Mount Carmel: Volume II The Post Tridentine Period 1550-1600* (Darien, Illinois 60559; Cass Ave. N., at I-55 (Stevenson): Carmelite Spiritual Center, 1976 [no copyright], passim.

²⁶Victoria Lincoln, *Teresa: A Woman. A Biography of Teresa of Avila*, page 75 as cited in the Jodi Bilinkoff review in *The Catholic Historical Review* 73 (July 1987): 613-614.

²⁷ John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 923.

²⁸ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 484.

²⁹ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 482.

³⁰ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 479. The text spells her name as "Meyer's" but the footnote as "Meyers." The Professor supposes ?? the correct spelling is "Meyers" and finds this as a prime example for his insistence that students avoid the use of the apostrophe as much as possible in formal writing.

³¹ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 478.

³² Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), pages 478-479, 483.

³³ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 484-485.

³⁴ Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., "Living in Ambiguity: A Paradigm Shift Experienced by the Sister Formation Movement," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (July 1993), page 485.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

³⁵ Rega Wood, St. Bonaventure University, review of David Burr, Eucharistic Presence and Conversion in Late Thirteenth-Century Franciscan Thought in The American Historical Review 91 (June 1985): 664-665.

³⁶ On page 284 in the seventh edition, Chambers has 1265?, but *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 1170 uses 1266 without a question mark. The *Encyclopedia* indexes Scotus under S as would the professor. Chambers indexes Scotus under D. The *Encyclopedia* does give a reference at Duns back to Scotus. Chambers does not recognize Scotus under the Ss.

³⁷ John Duns Scotus is indexed in the fifth edition of Chambers on page 371. John Duns Scotus is indexed under "D," Duns Scotus, John in the fifth, sixth (page 275), and seventh (page 285-286) editions.

³⁸ Joseph Klaitz review of Dale K. Van Kley, The Damians Affair and the Unraveling of the "Ancien Regime," 1750-1770, The American Historical Review, Vol. 91, Number 5 (December 1986), p. 1213-4.

³⁹ William V. Hudon, "Religion and Society in Early Modern Italy ??", *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 101, No. 3 (June 1996), page 788.

⁴⁰ William V. Hudon, "Religion and Society in Early Modern Italy ??", *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 101, No. 3 (June 1996), page 788-789.

⁴¹ Georgette M. Dorn, review of *Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America*, Asuncion Lavrin, editor in *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 75??, No. ??2 (April 1989??), pages 346-347.

⁴² William V. Hudon, "Religion and Society in Early Modern Italy ??", *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 101, No. 3 (June 1996), page 789.

⁴³ Charles H. O'Brien, review of Jerry H. Bentley, Humanists and Holy Writ: New Testament Scholarship in the Renaissance in The American Historical Review 89 (October 1984): 1039-1040.

⁴⁴ The fifth edition of Chambers indexes Erasmus on pages 482, 483, and 543-544. The sixth edition of Chambers indexes Erasmus, Desiderius on pages 377, 378, 393-395, 394f, 405 and 511. The seventh edition of Chambers indexes Erasmus, Desiderius (humanist) on pages 435, 435-436 and Erasmus of Rotterdam on pages 420, 421. *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 474 writes, "**Erasmus, Desiderius**, also knows as Erasmus of Rotterdam . . ." The professor wonders if Chambers has not erred indexing Erasmus twice.

⁴⁵ In the fifth edition, pages 543-544, in the seventh edition, page 436.

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

HIS 101--34 Catholicism © January 27, 2000

Raymond J. Jirran

⁴⁶ Jerry H. Bentley, Humanists and Holy Writ: New Testament Scholarship in the Renaissance, page 175 as cited in the review by Charles H. O'Brien in The American Historical Review 89 (October 1984): 1039-1040.

⁴⁷ Walter Brandmuller, "Traditio Scripturae Interpres: The Teaching of the Councils on the Right Interpretation of Scripture up to the Council of Trent," The Catholic Historical Review 73 (October 1987): 523 ff.

⁴⁸ ???, ??? probably the bowling textbook used at Thomas Nelson Community College in 1988, pages 2-3 and 38-39.

⁴⁹ John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 186.

⁵⁰ John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 193.

⁵¹ John W. O'Malley, S.J., "Was Ignatius Loyola A Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (April 1991), page 186.

⁵² *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism*, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 668.

⁵³ *All the Paintings of Titian Part 1 and 2 (1488-1545) Part 3 and 4 (1546-1576): Volumes Twenty-nine through Thirty-two in the Complete Library of World Art* (New York: Hawthorn Books, Inc., 1960)