

**A. Introduction<sup>1</sup>**

The last lesson evaluated ethnocentrism. This lesson looks to the cause of much ethnocentrism, religion. This lesson considers religious development on a worldwide basis. The course goal in this lesson is **to evaluate the impact of religion on civilization according to criteria of the people, places, and times involved and the degrees of certitude warranted**. This lesson is key to understanding the professor. The issue is which is to determine which, truth or politics. The argument is that which gives Western civilization identity is mainly religious value.

**B. The Axial Period**

Beginning about 800 B.C., like wheat in the springtime, human thought seemed to break new ground, never to turn back. This thought developed at the same relative time, independently, in different places. In the broad sense, this Axial Period in history lasted from 800 B.C. until 200 B.C. During this time, the great religious thought of humanity changed, developed, and has, since then, remained comparatively the same. For the West, this meant ultimately that truth is supposed to determine politics, regardless of what actually happens. Truth is agreement between mental and extra-mental reality. Politics is the exercise of human power, any human power. Universities are the institution in Western civilization that most attests to the primacy of truth over politics. A variety of ways, such as intuition, reason, and faith, can reach truth. In the struggle between truth and politics, the manner in which thought obtains truth is immaterial. Truth does not contradict itself.

When one extends the broad Axial Period<sup>2</sup> forward to Jesus, the only fundamentally new thing since then has been the development of Seventeenth Century A.D. scientific technology. Technology has meant a change in material conditions, comparable in importance to the discovery of agriculture for the beginning of urban civilization. Technology has not brought any fundamental growth of new, moral, religious values.

**C. New Thinking**

The most important spiritual development of the First Millennium B.C. was the creation of new values and views of life. These new outlooks enabled people to transcend natural forces and seek to control their own biological environment rather than mystically submit to nature as a function of the gods. These new values marked a decisive break with the Neolithic and Paleolithic past.

Such similar breaks were taking place in five different areas of the world: (a) Iran; (b) the Greek Peninsula; (c) Palestine; (d) India; (e) China. Two specific products of the Axial Period, the ethical monotheism of the Jewish prophets and the rationalism of the Greek philosophers, largely shaped the attitudes of the Western mind. A third product, the ethical dualism of Zoroaster, contributed indirectly to the Western tradition through its later influence on Judaism and Christianity.

Zoroastrianism maintained that there are good spirits, headed by Ahura Mazda and bad spirits, headed by Ahriman. The Christian counterpoints are Michael the Archangel and Satan. Zoroastrianism is a Persian religion, which Alexander sent into decline. Zoroastrianism reemerged in the Third Century A.D. until the mid-Seventh Century when Zoroastrianism gave way to Islam.<sup>3</sup>

**D. Chronological Parallelism**

Three religious teachers were almost exact contemporaries. Confucius lived about 551-479 B.C. and Buddha about 563-483 B.C. The most plausible dating for Zoroaster focuses around 569-560 B.C. Lao Tzu, the founder of Taoism and Mahavira, who should probably be regarded as the founder of Jainism,<sup>4</sup> are more shadowy figures, but according to apparently reliable traditions, they lived at the same time as Confucius and Buddha.

In Palestine the line of monotheistic prophets, which had begun with Amos of Tekoa halfway through the Eighth Century, reached its culmination near the end of the Sixth Century with Deutero-Isaiah, that is the second Isaiah. Among the Greeks, the Sixth Century brought the inauguration of philosophical speculation with the work of Thales and his successors. The Sixth Century also marked the trend towards democracy in Athens. These intellectual achievements of the Sixth Century, considered together, appear to constitute a type of spiritual mutation in human development, comparable to what happens when a new species emerges in biological evolution.<sup>5</sup>

As time progressed, more thought begot less religious fervor among the Athenians and Romans, whereas among the Jews, more thought increased fervor.<sup>6</sup> Christianity was able to maintain its fervor in the face of Jerusalem and Athens, both. Christian identity crystallized during the Middle Ages, at the expense of the Jews. Knowledge begot self-righteous bigotry, rather than tolerance.<sup>7</sup>

Individualism, rationalism, and universalism, in varying degrees and proportions, characterized all the thinkers of the Axial Period. Yet, it was in this very period that the divergences in spiritual direction between East and West first became clearly apparent, the West inclining more towards the control of inner self, the East more towards the control of environment. These divergences remain to the present time. Recognizing these divergences is standard historical fare. The professor recognizes both divergences as aspects of power, of politics. Truth validates the exercise of Western power. Control validates the exercise of Eastern power; i.e. in the East power validates power. Self-control validates eastern power.

**E. Conclusion**

Students have considered how people began to reflect upon themselves and to free themselves from a total identification with nature. This occurred in the context of worldwide development as well as the happenings of the ancient Near East. Consideration of Palestine has enabled the student to evaluate the impact of religion on civilization. Students are to read the assignment in Chambers.

## Supplement

**F. Introduction**

How to decide what belongs in the lecture proper and what belongs here is difficult. What is in the mainstream of historical thinking has been the determining factor. Work in the area of women's studies and other work, concentrating on the final meaning of biblical redaction changed in the period since 1970. Biblical study finds its place through its study of the meaning of texts. In retirement, the professor continues to pursue the study of Sacred Scripture at <http://www.western-civilization.com/>. The Book of Jonah is a key for distinguishing among Christians, particularly in this area. For that reason, there is a section on Jonah. The section on Buddhism and Confucianism purposively draws Western civilization into a global context.

**G. New Thinking (continued)**

In India and China, problems similar to those faced by the Jewish prophets, Greek philosophers, and Zoroastrians evoked comparable responses. As in the Middle East, barbarians overran both of these Oriental areas during the Second Millennium: India, by the Aryans from the north; China, by the Chou (jo) from the Mongolian steppes. In both places there followed a period of warfare among a number of small states. As in the Middle East: (a) the clash of competing states and peoples; (b) the rise of militarism; (c) the decline of priestly authority; and (d) the growth of individualistic attitudes impelled people to search for new faith affirming a human rather than an animistic and tribal view of life. In India, the Axial Period saw the mystic teachings of the Upanishads that remain the foundation of modern Hinduism. The Upanishads are ancient Hindu writings dating from 900 B.C. The Upanishads form the final section of the Veda, which is the Hindu equivalent of the Bible.<sup>8</sup> There is a major difference between Taoism and Buddhism because these spiritualities contain no theistic implications like Christianity. Taoism and Buddhism conjure up a void, where Christianity develops theological categories.<sup>9</sup> In China, this Second Millennium eventually produced Taoism and Confucianism, both of which the Supplement develops.

For the first time in human existence, most of the Axial Period thinkers began with humans as individuals, asked themselves fundamental questions about the meaning and purpose of his existence, and attempted to answer their queries in rational terms. Axial Period thinkers repudiated the whole tribal heritage of polytheism and nature-worship. These thinkers were also opposed to magic in all its forms, to witchcraft, divination, and the fertility cults. They recognized that gods could not be coerced or placated by sacrifices or other ceremonial rites. In this way, conceptions of both natural and moral law began to disentangle from the fantasies of the human imagination. People were beginning to think objectively and to recognize the reality of sequences of cause and effect in both the physical and non-physical realm.

Richard A. McCormick, S.J., [The Critical Calling: Reflections on Moral Dilemmas Since Vatican II](#),<sup>10</sup> writes of *biologism*, which is "preoccupation with biological explanations in the analysis of social situations."<sup>11</sup> McCormick seems to continue the main part of this lecture, "these new outlooks (that) enabled people to transcend natural forces and seek to control their own biological environment, rather than mystically submit to nature as a function of the gods."

**H. From Egypt to the Bible**

That ancient Egyptians had a different view of human sexuality from that of Western civilization, was developed in the last lesson. There is a parallel between Egyptian wisdom literature and the wisdom literature of the Bible. The Bible presents Lady Wisdom in erotic language.<sup>12</sup> The Bible, drawing on Egyptian metaphors, suggests that fidelity to one's wife is also an approach to Lady Wisdom;<sup>13</sup> Dame Folly is a seductive strange woman, the opposite of Lady Wisdom.<sup>14</sup> This means that the emphasis on proper sexual conduct in Western civilization has a double meaning: sexual fidelity is a symbol of attachment to Lady Wisdom. Infidelity is an affront to her. Students of Western civilization excel in fidelity to Lady Wisdom.

The femininity of biblical wisdom is proper. The feminine in the biblical images of women and of God provides a paradigm of wisdom, in the sense of the preference of verbal communication over brute force.<sup>15</sup> The role of females in ancient Israelite history is to establish the connections and the dysfunctions between the world and the individual and then to mediate the differences between them. In the Egyptian world, the main function of the female was to pass on the family name, a sort of mediation in itself. The point of this paragraph is to show that religion has not developed in a cultural vacuum.

From where did the historical Israel come? The professor has relied heavily on Roland De Vaux, tr. by David Smith, The Early History of Israel (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1978), 886 pages. There are currently three scholarly opinions: (1) when Abraham left Ur about 1900 B.C.; (2) when Israel revolted about 1500 B.C.; (3) when Israel gradually began migrating into Palestine about 1200 B.C. The professor prefers the 1900 B.C. opinion.<sup>16</sup> Currently, the earliest written record of Israel dates from 1207 B.C., when the Egyptian Pharaoh Merenptah wrote, "Israel is laid waste and his seed is not."<sup>17</sup> Since DeVaux was translated into English, several other exemplary works have arrived.<sup>18</sup>

Gosta W. Ahlstrom, The History of Ancient Palestine from the Palaeolithic Period to Alexander's Conquest has special merit for distrusting biblical literature as reliable historiography. This is an essential reference work on the history of ancient Palestine.<sup>19</sup> Another study of similar genre is Amihai Mazar, Archaeology of the Land of the Bible: 10,000-586 B.C.E. The first temple was destroyed in 586.<sup>20</sup> Lester L. Grabbe tells the story from 539 B.C.E. to 135 C.E. in Judaism from Cyrus to Hadrian. Vol. 1, The Persian and Greek Periods. Vol. 2, The Roman Period.<sup>21</sup>

The Bible is better regarded as about theology than history. Scholars err to read the Bible overly much as history. Jeremy Zwelling presents this idea in "The Fictions of Biblical History" a review of Thomas L. Thompson, The Mythic Past: Biblical Archaeology and the Myth of Israel, History and Theory: Studies in the Philosophy of History, Vol. 39, No. 1, 2000, pages 117-141. In the 1980s scholars despaired of ever reconstructing Biblical history. The professor never had such despair. The phrase making the most sense to the professor is "*stories* [emphasis in the original] about origins (nor origins themselves) are what should be the focus of biblical scholarship."<sup>22</sup> A perspective on Biblical narratives is "educating the emotions in a safe place and in a safe way."<sup>23</sup>

Scholars have examined whether the Jewish God developed an identity distinct from the surrounding Canaanite culture. Israelite concepts of God have two features, one convergence with the Canaanites, the other differentiation. Differentiation only begins in the Ninth Century

Raymond J. Jirran

B.C.<sup>24</sup> The archaeological evidence indicates that Judah became a centralized state only in the Eighth Century B.C.. When Jerusalem fell in 586 B.C., the entire system also collapsed.<sup>25</sup>

At first, God was a nationalistic God. Then God became a warrior helper to Israel in the late Eighth to Seventh Centuries B.C. During the exile or later, God became active as direct combatant. The dating is problematic because of difficulties with redaction criticism, that is using language types to determine dates. The point seems to be that God does not participate in wars of aggression but of liberation and defense.<sup>26</sup> Just as caution must be exercised interpreting the facts of Israeli history, so must caution be exercised interpreting the facts of women's history.

### 1. Marriage

Gerda Lerner in The Creation of Patriarchy offers important feminist insights regarding the institution of marriage.<sup>27</sup> Dr. Jirran first learned of Gerda Lerner at an American Historical Association annual meeting, probably in Washington, D.C. about 1976. Two early bird activities included a session on teaching and an open house for women historians. Bored with the session on teaching, Dr. Jirran went to the open house where the women scholars made him welcome. They themselves brought up the difficulty women have trying to present feminist history without either becoming or appearing hysterical.

Her fellow scholars pointed to Gerda Lerner as the one with the best work. She had been a refugee from Nazi Germany. In the spring of 1992, Dr. Jirran influenced the Tidewater Historians to take The Creation of Patriarchy for discussion. First, to amazement of Dr. Jirran, The Catholic Biblical Quarterly has not reviewed it. Second, one of the other professors checked the Old Dominion University library to find only one scholarly review and that not in a scholarly journal, but in something like the New York Times Book Review. The consensus among the Tidewater Historians was that Lerner was out of her field as she entered ancient history. While we were uncomfortable with many of her facts, she did seem to make an effective point concerning assumptions. Her point was that since society was not always patriarchal, society need not remain patriarchal.

What Dr. Jirran found particularly disturbing was her proposition that patriarchal assumptions emanate from the revealed word of God. Up until he read Gerda Lerner, Dr. Jirran had felt comfortable with the notion that the Ninth Commandment, "Thou shalt not covet thy neighbor's wife," was not designed to place wives and goods in the same category. The Tenth Commandment is "Thou shalt not covet thy neighbor's goods."

The reason for not just moving along and ducking the issue is that so much depends on the results. Dr. Jirran is unwilling to present history according to assumptions which may not be in the best interests of his students to accept. It does not take a rocket scientist to understand that sexist assumptions undergird Western civilization. There is nothing wrong with a scholar taking his students into the gray areas, where truth is unclear. That is the nature of what is happening here.

Feminist theologians themselves have not been clear in defining patriarchy in ancient Israel. Feminist theologians have not carefully delineated what patriarchy meant in the informal areas. Such delineation may modify Biblical androcentrism.<sup>28</sup>

Between 1200 and 1000 B.C., humans moved into highland areas, which demanded more labor-intensive work for survival. The ability of women to reproduce became more valuable. At the end of the Bronze Age, about 1200, endemic disease caused population decline and increased the importance of reproduction. What appears as sexism is merely a reflection of the increased need to reproduce.<sup>29</sup>

The clearest sign of Old Testament Biblical sexism as pointed out by Gerda Lerner is that God never speaks directly to women, but only to men. One of the Tidewater professors who knew Gerda Lerner personally estimated her as being in her early seventies in 1992. No one among us knew how she was coming with volume two of her study, which would have brought her through New Testament times. She published that second volume the next year, in 1993.<sup>30</sup>

Some have claimed that women were unable to keep up with the men in hunting and gathering societies. When hunting and gathering, which still exist, are studied, however, women produce on the average sixty-percent or more of the food. In early societies, men and women take on a variety of roles, depending on the society.

What seems to have happened was not inherently biological. When tribes needed increased population, women became valuable as reproducers. Women accepted the role of sharing and nurturing rather than competing and dominating. Women became commodities, suitable for trading. That is what underlies giving the bride away. Mom never gives her away. This is always a deal among men. The professor wonders whether once men learned how to enslave women, then they found out that, they could enslave other men by treating them like women. The point is that marriage entangles sexual double standards.<sup>31</sup>

The transition from matrilocality to patrilocality is traceable to Rachel, the wife of Jacob. Jacob was the grandson of Abraham. Under the old order expectations, Jacob would have had Jacob stay with Laban, the father of Rachel. The reason Rachel stole the teraphim from Laban was that the teraphim signified legal title to an estate. The action of Rachel symbolized recognition of the change from matrilocality to patrilocality.<sup>32</sup> Gerda Lerner associates patriarchy with control of the reproductive power of women.

Something on the nature of ancient Jewish marriage also is appropriate. The Babylonian Exile ended in 520 B.C. In the following two centuries, marriage received its written norm. Frederich Engles related monogamy to the institution of private property. Monogamy is unrelated to the observation of Dr. Jirran that history tends to treat women as prizes of war. There are three different ways of "taking" a woman in biblical Israel (Genesis 34), in post-biblical Israel and among other ancient peoples: (1) as a prostitute, (2) as a wife, and (3) as a prisoner. The Original Testament has no single term corresponding to matrimony. Scholar Carol Meyers finds that the ultimate displacement of women from places of power and status among the ancient Israelites did not occur until the Greco-Roman period, when dualistic thinking identified the female with evil and bodiliness.<sup>33</sup>

There were two phases in Jewish matrimonial procedure. The first phase was the conclusion of the matrimonial contract. The second phase was the completion of the procedure with nuptial

Raymond J. Jirran

ceremonies and festivities. The best current scholarship regards the modern concept of a wedding as developing in the late Middle Ages and not found in ancient history. The wife is exclusively and irrevocably bound to the husband. While in practice he is not so bound to her, the husband is not absolute. He does not own either his wife or her possessions. She has the right to have her children recognized as the legitimate descendants of her husband.

After the Exile of the ancient Jews, the right to divorce tended to become limited to cases where an obligation to divorce existed due to infidelity, mixed unions, or illegitimate unions. According to the scripture scholar, Angelo Tosato, the institution of Jewish marriage, tracked through time, was rather an instrument of emancipation than of female subjugation. Tosato wrote in 1985.<sup>34</sup> Gerda Lerner wrote after that, in 1986. Lerner does not include Tosato in her bibliography, though she does mention De Vaux.<sup>35</sup> Lerner does not seem to agree that Jewish marriage was rather an instrument of emancipation than of female subjugation.

## 2. Texts

Practicing historians generally do not regard the Torah or Jewish commentary on the Bible, and the New Testament as "historical." Actually, both are "historical." All writing of history must be synecdochical, that is, substituting part for the whole (as fifty sail for fifty ships), part for the whole (as society for high society, species for genus (as cutthroat for assassin), genus for species (as a creature for a man), or the name of the material for the thing made (as boards for stage).<sup>36</sup> Knowing that helps the reader grasp the difficulty involved when trying to determine historical objectivity, or, as the course goal words it, "to evaluate . . . the degrees of certitude warranted."

Torah (tohr'ah; Heb., "instruction"), the traditional Jewish designation for the Pentateuch. Torah can be used generically to refer to commands and rulings (Gen. 26:5; Exod. 18:16) or to instruction, particularly for priests (Deut. 17:10-11; 33:10). The term epitomized the instruction that God gave through Moses (Josh 1:7; 1 Kgs. 2:3). It came to be applied to the collection of such instruction found in the book of Deuteronomy (Deut 1:5; 4:8; 28:58, 61, 31:26) a version of which was found in the Temple under Josiah (2 Kgs 22:8, 23:25). From that application arose the more comprehensive reference to the whole of the Pentateuch.<sup>37</sup>

This means that there is a problem getting historians to recognize the value of Biblical sources. There is a further problem getting historians to recognize the need for a sound philosophy of history. Philosophers themselves can generally be ignored because philosophers argue a priori, rather than from what historians actually do.<sup>38</sup>

Historians usually defend their explanations by arguing that theirs are better than competing versions, not that their explanations are the last word about anything. Students arguing multiple-choice exercises must adapt this historical mode. One ideal form of multiple-choice exercise is to have all of the responses correct, thereby forcing both student and professor to argue which response is most satisfactory. Historians also have never successfully argued in favor of the necessary subjectivity of historical studies. In other words, history involves both objectivity and subjectivity.<sup>39</sup>

Raymond Martin examines the historical relationship between the synoptic Gospels of Matthew, Mark, and Luke.<sup>40</sup> Martin concludes that what the historians conclude about the synoptics can be accepted because a more objective scientific analysis is unlikely. While historians offer nothing fixed and determined about the relationship, the idea that Matthew and Luke embellished Mark carries more weight than other approaches. Considering the New Testament is easier than the Original Testament.

There is a general consensus among scripture scholars that Jewish biblical texts existed for years in oral form before they were committed to writing, perhaps as early as 1400 B.C. or as late as 1000 B.C. By studying the language used, scholars conclude that the biblical writers pulled four oral traditions together to compose Genesis-Kings, from creation to conquest. Those traditions can be dated: J and E for 1200-722; P 722-609; D 640-540; and the final rendition of all four against the events of 539-540. J, E, and D are simply conventions scholars use for considering the different layers identified in biblical language.<sup>41</sup>

The J tradition may be from a woman. E seems to have been written by priests outside of Jerusalem. P stems from the temple priests at Jerusalem. The final rendition makes sense as having been composed by yet different priests outside of Jerusalem.

According to one interpretation, God fulfills the promise of land in the conquest under Joshua. The land is lost because the Jews broke the covenant and there is no hope. According to other interpretations, there is hope, because the promise was unconditional. A final interpretation is that hope is ambiguous. The people betrayed God, but God may yet remember his promise of land to them if they mend their ways. The last is the favored current interpretation among scholars.<sup>42</sup>

The point of this lecture is not so much what happened as how to read the evidence. When work is edited, wherein lies the truth? In the last edition? In the first edition? Somewhere in between? In some other sort of relationship between reader and writer? There is no consensus on an answer to these questions. Modern secular literary theory has affected Bible studies and these studies, in turn, are being used to test the notion of the degree of certitude warranted in the antecedents to Western civilization.

It is well to note that the difference between the Hebrew God and the Greek gods was that the Hebrew God was literate. While the Greek gods were gods of action, they were illiterate. The muses could inspire the poets, but could not write themselves. For the Greeks only oral expression communicated with the soul. Written communication was counterfeit.<sup>43</sup>

The Hebrew God reduplicated in the reader the image of the author in a manner analogous to the way in which images were consecrated to other deities. There is thus a reciprocity between how the human reader views his God and his very self. Students are invited to check what Gerda Lerner writes about educating Jewish women to read.<sup>44</sup>

### ***I. Jonah***

Some of the problems associated with the Jonah and the whale narrative can be identified as how to consider animals in sackcloth or a city fifty miles wide. The real problem is with the belly of

Raymond J. Jirran

the fish. Better scholarly thinking regards that event as a deliverance of some sort, "real praise for actual deliverance [rather] than proleptic [anticipated] thanksgiving mixed with lament."<sup>45</sup> The book of Jonah is a book about God and his prophet, with Assyria as an ironic stage-prop and Israel with no role whatsoever. The postexilic audience for which the Book of Jonah was compiled, knew that Assyria was ultimately punished for gross arrogance before disappearing entirely from history.

What about the history of the area? There is at least one study of Damascus from its beginnings to its fall to the Assyrians in 732 B.C.<sup>46</sup> The period of greatest vitality for the city of Damascus was 931-842 B.C. Damascus may be found in the seventh edition of Chambers on the inside front cover map, "Physiography of Europe" in the Levant on the eastern Mediterranean Sea. Tribute by Damascus to Assyria began by 796 B.C. After 732, the Assyrian provincial system incorporated Damascus. Page 24, column 2, paragraph 2 in the seventh edition of Chambers notes that Assyria conquered Israel in 722. In 612, the Assyrians lost control of their empire to the Babylonians.

### **J. Solomon**

The intent of what follows is not to titillate the mind but to offer some facts useful for integrating Western civilization into global history. In August 1989, Gene Savoy found three tablets each weighing several tons and measuring about five by ten feet, with inscriptions similar to Phoenician and Semitic hieroglyphs. These came from the Gran Vilaya ruins, about four hundred miles north of Lima, Peru. The discovered hieroglyphs were similar to those used at the time of King Solomon and included one identical to the symbol that always appeared on the ships Solomon sent to the legendary land of Ophir, which the Bible described as the source of his gold.<sup>47</sup>

### **K. Biblical Scholarship<sup>48</sup>**

Since many students come out of evangelical backgrounds some of the differences between evangelical biblical scholarship and the dominant trends in the university study of Scripture merit delineation. Many times more copies of the New International Version and The Living Bible, which the evangelicals prefer, are sold than are copies of the Revised Standard Version, preferred by the academy.

Between 1880 and 1920 academic professionalization occurred throughout Western civilization. This meant that the once secure conventions of pious scholarship fell almost completely out of favor. Evangelicals preferred to meet criticism with rebuttals, rather than accommodation. After 1940, popular evangelical leaders, especially Billy Graham, began to reengage university scholarship. The universities, however, have yet to come to renewed terms with that evangelical scholarship which does meet the demands of academic rigor. The professor favors the evangelical approach, stressing the truthfulness of the Bible. With the evangelicals, the professor denies that history writing is thoroughly relative to the perspective of the historian.

Catholic interpretations of the Bible give a preeminent place to religious authority. Mainline or liberal Protestantism reserves that preeminence to technical expertise. Evangelicals hold up popular approval. The professor regards all three as essential.

Raymond J. Jirran

**L. Canticles, Song of Songs, or Solomon's Song**

Solomon's Song is the most controversial piece in all of literature, controversial because of its sexiness. The best scholarly translation is earthy to the point of pornography. This is a song about a love between a man and a woman, an explicit song, far from Platonic.<sup>49</sup>

The meaning of the Song of Songs is religions, in the final analysis. "The love that forms human partnership and community, and that sustains the whole of creation is a gift of God's own self."<sup>50</sup> The Song is relevant to the perennial problems associated with human sexuality. Of special note to the professor is the new translation of "Black am I, and beautiful" versus St. Jerome's Latin for "Black I am, *but* shapely." The reviewer cites "the traditional melanophobia" for the difference in translations. The professor takes traditional melanophobia to be some sort of racism.

**M. Hanukkah**

The traditional story of Hanukkah is about a miracle of lights. There is an additional explanation, more in tune with historical standards. Halley's Comet, which appears about once every seventy-five years, appeared in December 164 B.C., the very month and year the temple was rededicated by Judas Maccabaeus. The lights of the Hanukkah festival may well have something to do with the appearance of Halley's Comet in the night sky at the same time.<sup>51</sup>

Trying to get a sense of what life must have been like in 164 B.C. requires taking into consideration that the life expectancy was twenty-eight and that more than half of all babies died before the age of five.<sup>52</sup> People did not have much time to adjust or become educated. The average of community college students is twenty-eight. While it may be impossible to calculate how many people were in each age cohort, at least we know that people in the Twenty-first century, on the average, are living longer than ever before. This demographic fact seems reasonable to project elsewhere. The section on Agrippa in Topic 13--Christianity, develops more on Hanukkah.

**N. Buddhism and Confucianism**

Buddha means enlightened one and is the title given to the founder of Buddhism, Siddhartha Gautama (ca. 563-483). Though at age twenty-nine Buddha renounced the world to become a wandering ascetic,<sup>53</sup> he recognized the significance of economic function as being basic to any society. This recognition of the importance of economics indicated his contribution to ideas on social status. Economic good times crowded people into cities, thereby bringing about their stratification into classes.<sup>54</sup> Buddhism began in India and entered China in the First Century A.D., where it met opposition from Confucianism and Taoism.<sup>55</sup>

Taoism developed in Third Century B.C. China as both a religion and a philosophy. Taoism condemned the social virtues of Confucianism as symptoms of excessive government. Later, Taoism concentrated on effects and studied alchemy, the forerunner of modern chemistry. During the 1950s, the Communists officially proscribed Taoism. Today Taoism is mainly in Taiwan.<sup>56</sup>

Confucius lived ca. 551-479 B.C. as a minor government bureaucrat. Confucius developed a series of sayings or ethical precepts designed for the management of society. Whereas Buddhism was a part of Hinduism and, thereby, religious, Confucianism was entirely rational and non-religious. Confucianism first appeared in the Third Century B.C.; was successfully challenged

Raymond J. Jirran

by the religious systems of Taoism and Buddhism from the Third to the Seventh Centuries A.D.; revived under the T'ang Dynasty from 618 to 906. A neo-Confucianism developed with the Sung from 960 to 1279, which drew on the beliefs of Taoism and Zen Buddhism. A similar combining of faith and reason was taking place contemporaneously in medieval Europe. St. Thomas Aquinas died in 1274. During the Ming period from 1368 to 1644, Confucianism stressed meditation and intuitive knowledge. After that, Confucianism declined in importance with the end of the Chinese monarchy by 1912 and the beginning of Communism in 1949.<sup>57</sup>

Buddhism and Confucianism were on broadly patterned collision paths traced through funerary practices in medieval China. Buddhism was otherworldly and had no problem with cremation. Confucianism was this worldly and found cremation repugnant.<sup>58</sup> Zen Buddhism is in Japan as well as China and grounds itself in the practice of meditation rather than adherence to scriptural doctrine. Zen Buddhism began in the Fifth Century A.D.

From the Fifth Century B.C. until the Tenth Century A.D., the Chinese buried their dead. From the Tenth Century until the Fourteenth Century, cremation became an accepted Buddhist practice in China. The first part of that period was under native Chinese rulers, the Sung (960-1297). The dates for Marco Polo are 1275-1292. The latter part of that period was under foreign Mongol rule, the Yuan (1215-1368). The Ming (1368-1644) drove out the foreigners and their foreign funerary practice of cremation along with them because the practice was foreign.<sup>59</sup>

So what? So it seems that freezing the mind with the Buddhist ancestral focus harms, all the while freeing, the mind from the material cares of a decent burial, is no more beneficial than focusing the mind on material needs, such as ancestor worship and burial or politics. For the Buddhist, politics and truth are irrelevant. For the Confucian politics determines truth. For the Westerner, truth is relevant to politics and is to determine politics. The purpose of this paragraph is didactic rather than polemic. Nonsense is difficult to remember. The professor is more offering a way in which to remember what happened than professing much of an explanation of what actually occurred.

#### **N. Conclusion**

Evaluating the impact of religion on civilization requires at least implicitly evaluating the impact of civilization on religion. This supplement does more of the latter. The Book of Jonah, as all biblical texts, and the love of wisdom not only affected the intellectual life, but also were affected by the intellectual life. These additional considerations are also useful for evaluating the impact of religion on civilization.

Comments on the Seventh Edition of Chambers, pages 0021-0033

In the opinion of the professor, Chambers is the most scholarly textbook on the market. Chambers well represents mainstream thinking in the history profession. The professor, however, disagrees in many significant ways with mainstream thinking. These disagreements are set forth in the following comments.

Page Column

Paragraph  
Line

0022-0023

. . . but literal accuracy is not . . . can be misinterpreted.

The professor regards the literal meaning as divinely inspired. The question is what is the literal meaning? The literal meaning is whatever the human writer may have meant when the writing took place. One ought not to discuss literal accuracy without taking into consideration the manner of writing under examination.

0023 1 2

second last Here the Bible is the most influential book in the Western tradition, though on page 0016, column 1, paragraph 2, third last to the last line Chambers states, as noted above, "In fact, not until the Greeks did the ancient world have another literature with the variety and beauty equal to that of Egypt." At that point, my comment was, "What about the Bible, especially the Psalms? Chambers may be correct, but he hurts credibility in assuming that students are unaware of the beauty of the Psalms." Chambers has a way of balancing opinions from page to page.

0023 1 4 4

"The Salvation of Israel" is on page 24. What "p.xx" means here is beyond the professor.

0023 1 4 9 and 13

". . . covenant . . . covenant . . ."  
see page 414, column 2, paragraph 3, lines 9 and 13 for a Christian reference.

0023 1 second last and last line . . . the Commandments do not deny the existence of other gods . . . causes trouble with the concept of Jewish monotheism. Part of the problem with Jesus placing himself on the same level as God for example in John 14: 9-11 is the problem of monotheism. The doctrine of the Trinity eventually solves the problem.. The point is that there is historical development of doctrine. In the beginning, it seems that the Jews only recognized their God as one among many Gods, that is the first Jews accepted the notion of polytheism. As time went on not only did the Jews regard their God as the supreme god, but, eventually as the only God. The professor does not think that sophisticated theologians have examined this section of Chambers.

0023 2 2 last line

". . . what could forge a stronger bond than having the whole people swear allegiance to a single god?" projects a disingenuous assumption. Among many assumptions, Chambers seems to refuse the notion that God not only exists, but has also entered history. The professor sees political motivation in such an assumption associated with modernism. Rejecting modernism seems to reject prioritizing truth

Raymond J. Jirran

over religious politics. The professor would rather reject religious politics in the form of modernism rejecting the truth, the facts, regardless of where the facts and truth may then lead. The knack of the historian is to cling to the truth with all of the moral force possible in the face of whatever political pressures may exist to the contrary. Such an attitude can get historians into lots of political trouble, but is at the core of professionalism.

- 0023 2 last two lines The historical reality of Moses . . . causes lots of trouble because historians are confident that each and every time Moses is mentioned in the Bible the same individual person cannot be meant. The professor thinks that Chambers is correct to recognize the historical reality of Moses but that Chambers is incorrect to imply that Moses in the Bible refers to more than one individual.
- 0025 1 2 6 ...no military power . . . is about the challenge between truth and politics. Prophets are about truth in a way that is appropriate to historians. Historians are necessarily out of their field should they engage the future. In that sense, historians are not prophetic. In the sense, however, that historians tell the truth, even when the truth is not politically correct, historians are prophetic. Western civilization has institutionalized such truth-telling in colleges and universities.
- 0025 2 1 Christians, too, developed their theory of a Messiah . . . misses the Christian point of Jesus living resurrected in individuals by way of grace. This missed point is important because many Christian students experience this resurrected Christ through grace. Chambers is correct to note that Christians developed their theory of a Messiah who would return to rule on earth over all humanity, the Second Coming.
- 0026 1 2 1 To Israel, there was only one god . . . is Chambers making up for the polytheism mentioned at the bottom of page 0023, column 1?
- 0029 2 1 7 Bisitun is mentioned here without reference to the next page where Bisitun is pictured.
- 0031 1 2 second last line Chambers may be correct to mention Satan in Zechariah and Job, without mentioning Satan in 2 Samuel 19:17-24, where the better translation seems to be legal accuser. See Peggy L. Day, "Abishai the *satan* in 2 Samuel 19:14-24," in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 49, No. 4 (October 1987), pages 543-547.
- 0031 both columns The "passion for logical argument" is the passion for truth in the face of politics, here described as "radical individualism."

0031 last word "Greece," but there is no Greece, in the sense of a politically unified place, until the Twentieth Century AD. The professor was taught that Greeks is proper and Greece improper when referring to the ancient peoples. That continues to make sense to the professor, though professional historians do seem to ignore the distinction.

### Endnotes

1 On April 17, 1992, the first bibliographical essay based on the learning resources holdings at Thomas Nelson Community College originated. Dr. Jirran had a class that spring which ran out of comments. What he did that spring was to comment on bibliography. Classes rarely had access to such information. What had bothered Dr. Jirran was that he regularly went to the library to look at books accessed there, took notes on those books and then filed the whole away for some unknown future reference. Since the college was willing to let him expand his handouts, he developed what is now on the web first as a working document for his Thomas Nelson Community College students. It easily took four years for current library material to work its way here. What appeared immediately were references gathered from a variety of sources since about 1962. Sources cited in the other footnotes should not be repeated here.

Since going online in April, 1999, I have abandoned this practice, but not to the point of eliminating what is here. I am considering posting web sites instead. Should you be aware of a useful web site, please let me know at [rjirran@western-civilization.com](mailto:rjirran@western-civilization.com) Thank you.

Religious students sometimes want a recommendation for keeping up with secular history within a religious context. Dr. Jirran uses The American Catholic Historical Association, which publishes The Catholic Historical Review at The Catholic University of America in Washington, D.C., telephone (202) 319-5079. Vol. 77, No. 1 (January 1992) listed the membership fees as follows: Ordinary--\$30.00; student and retired (after twenty years of membership)--\$20.00; life--\$500.00. Sources, which follow, help mark non-Catholic sources which Dr. Jirran thinks have merit. When the source is identified as cited somewhere else, such as in the American Historical Review, that means that Dr. Jirran himself has not seen the source and students are invited to check it out.

#### Bibliography

TN/P2/3/G 1535/An Ernest K. Gann, The Antagonists (1970), a novel about the siege of Jerusalem.

Alan D. Crown, "Tidings and Instructions: How News Traveled in the Ancient Near East," J. Ec. Soc. Hist. Orient 17 (no. 3, '74), 244-71 as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5146

Daniel Jeremy Silver, "Moses and the Hungry Birds," Jewish Q. R., 64 (10-73), 123-53 as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5176.

Barbara Tiering, "The Biblical Source of Qumran Asceticism," J. Biblical Lit. 93 (9-74), 429-44, as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5178.

- Tamara Stech Wheeler, "Early Bronze Age Burial Customs in Western Anatolia," Am. J. Archaeol., 78, 10-74, 117-42, as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5181.
- P. Kyle McCarter, "The Early Diffusion of the Alphabet," Biblical Archaeologist, 37 (no. 3, '74), 54-68 as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5213.
- Robert R. Wilson, "The Old Testament Genealogies in Recent Research," J. Biblical Lit., 94 (June 1975): 169-89 as cited in Recently Published Articles, February 1976, page 180
- Y. Aharoni, "The Building Activities of David and Solomon," Israel Explor. J., 24 (no. 1 '74), pages 13-16 as cited in The American Historical Review, Vol. 80, (June 1975), page 758 #5136.
- Gary A. Rendsburg, "The Internal Consistency and Historical Reliability of the Biblical Genealogies," Vetus Test., 40 (no. 2, 1989): 166-78 as cited in Recently Published Articles, Vol. 15, No. 3, page 6, column 1.

The above citations should not only give the student a sense of the variety of other scholarly sources available, but should also give the student a sense of what it takes to keep up with the material. It took some sixteen years for Dr. Jirran to be able to return to this material and improve its dissemination. The student should note that all of the above sources emanate from the same time.

<sup>2</sup> The idea of the Axial Period is taken from Karl Jaspers, Of Gods and Men.

<sup>3</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), page 942.

<sup>4</sup> "Jainism" is a word which entered the English language in 1858 and means a religion of India originating in the Sixth Century B.C. and teaching liberation of the soul by right knowledge, right faith, and right conduct. --Webster's Ninth Collegiate Dictionary.

<sup>5</sup> See Karl Jaspers, Of Gods and Men.

<sup>6</sup> See A. T. Kraabel, review of Approaches to Ancient Judaism. Vol. 5, Studies in Judaism and its Greco-Roman Context, ed. William Scott Green, in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 49, No. 2 (April 1987), p. 359-360.

<sup>7</sup> See Gavin I. Langmuir, in "AHR Forum: Mission to the Jews and Jewish-Christian Contacts in the Polemical Literature of the High Middle Ages," by David Berger; "Scholarship and Intolerance in the Medieval Academy: The Study and Evaluation of Judaism in European Christendom" by Jeremy Cohen; "Comment," by Gavin Langmuir, The American Historical Review, Vol. 92, No. 3 (June 1986), p. 624.

<sup>8</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), pages 880-881.

<sup>9</sup> Steven Englund, "Converting to Religion after Its Demise: Thoughts on Marcel Gauchet and His American Reception," Cross Currents, Spring 1999, page 106.

---

<sup>10</sup> Richard A. McCormick, S.J., The Critical Calling: Reflections on Moral Dilemmas Since Vatican II (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1989, 2006), see for example page 112.

<sup>11</sup> <http://unabridged.merriam-webster.com/cgi-bin/unabridged?va=biologism&x=0&y=0> 081213.

<sup>12</sup> Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm., "Wisdom and Eros in Proverbs 1-9," the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 50 (1988), pages 600-603. Pertinent passages include Proverbs 18:22; 31:10; 8:35; Canticles 2:9; 5:4; 3:1; 5:6. For a book consisting principally of objections, disputes, and refutations, proposing only negative and polemical conclusions but demanding academic rigor, see Stuart Weeks, Early Israelite Wisdom, as reviewed by Jean-Jacques Lavoie in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 57, No. 2 (April 1995), pages 379-380.

<sup>13</sup> Proverbs 5:15-20.

<sup>14</sup> Proverbs 9:13-18.

<sup>15</sup> Carol Meyers, review of James G. Williams, Women Recounted: Narrative Thinking and the God of Israel in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 46 (1984), page 563.

<sup>16</sup> Alan J. Hauser, review of Niels Peter Lemche, Early Israel: Anthropological and Historical Studies on the Israelite Society Before the Monarchy in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, No. 3 (July 1989), pages 525-527. Bente Groth and Lynn C. Feinberg, "Early Israel a Look at Theories of Origin, Family Life, Domestic Cult and Village Religion," <http://www.bet-debora.de/2001/jewish-family/groth.htm> 0812241.

<sup>17</sup> Frank Yurco, Biblical Archaeology Review as described in Time, September 10, 1990, page 75.

<sup>18</sup> Rainer Albertz, A History of Israelite Religion in the Old Testament Period. Vol. 1, From the Beginnings to the End of the Monarchy. Vol. 2, From the Exile to the Macaques, tr. John Bowed, as reviewed by Leslie J. Hope, O.F.M. in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 59, No. 1 (January 1997), pages 103-105; The Cambridge History of Judaism, 1984 and 1989 are found in the Thomas Nelson Community College Library, call number B M 155.2 .C35 1984, v1/v2.

<sup>19</sup> Gosta W. Ahlstrom, The History of Ancient Palestine from the Paleolithic Period to Alexander's Conquest as reviewed by T. R. Hobbs in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 56, No. 4 (October 1994), pages 743-745.

<sup>20</sup> Amah Maser, Archaeology of the Land of the Bible: 10,000-586 B.C.E. is reviewed by Philip J. King in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 54, No. 3 (July 1992), pages 534-535.

<sup>21</sup> Lester L. Grabbe, Judaism from Cyrus to Hadrian. Vol. 1. The Persian and Greek Periods. Vol. 2, The Roman Period as reviewed by Anthony J. Saldarini, the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 55, No. 3 (July 1993), page 580-581.

- 
- <sup>22</sup> Jeremy Zwelling "The Fictions of Biblical History" a review of Thomas L. Thompson, The Mythic Past: Biblical Archaeology and the Myth of Israel, History and Theory: Studies in the Philosophy of History, Vol. 39, No. 1, (February 2000), page 129.
- <sup>23</sup> Thomas L. Thompson, The Mythic Past: Biblical Archaeology and the Myth of Israel, page 303 as cited in the review by Jeremy Zwelling "The Fictions of Biblical History" in History and Theory: Studies in the Philosophy of History, Vol. 39, No. 1 (February 2000), page 132.
- <sup>24</sup> Ronald S. Hendel, review of Mark S. Smith, The Early History of God: Yahweh and the Other Deities in Ancient Israel in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 54, No. 1 (January 1992), page 132.
- <sup>25</sup> Robert B. Coote, review of David W. Jamieson-Drake, Scribes and Schools in Monarchic Judah: A Socio-Archaeological Approach in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 55, No. 4 (October 1993), page 762.
- <sup>26</sup> Jerome T. Walsh, review of Anton Van Der Lingen, Les guerres de Yahve: L'implication de YHWH dans les guerres d'Israel selon les livres historiques de l'Ancien Testament in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly Vol. 54, No. 1 (January 1992), page 133-135.
- <sup>27</sup> Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986).
- <sup>28</sup> Gale A. Yee, review of Carol Meyers, Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 52, No. 3 (July 1990), pages 530-531.
- <sup>29</sup> Gale A. Yee, review of Carol Meyers, Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 52, No. 3 (July 1990), pages 531.
- <sup>30</sup> [http://www.temple.edu/tempress/authors/1635\\_qa3.html](http://www.temple.edu/tempress/authors/1635_qa3.html) 081213.
- <sup>31</sup> Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 22.
- <sup>32</sup> Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 168.
- <sup>33</sup> Gale A. Yee, review of Carol Meyers, Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 52, No. 3 (July 1990), pages 530-531.
- <sup>34</sup> Robert Althann, S.J., review of Angelo Tosato, Il matrimonio israelitico: Una teoria generale in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 47 1985, pages 149-150.
- <sup>35</sup> Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), page 298, last citation.

<sup>36</sup> David L. Schalk, review of Albert Cook, History/Writing in The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 5 (December 1990), page 1486.

<sup>37</sup> The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism, Richard P. McBrien, General Editor (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), page 1260

<sup>38</sup> Daniel J. Wilson, review of Raymond Martin, The Past within Us: An Empirical Approach to Philosophy of History in The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 5 (December 1992), pages 1486-1487.

<sup>39</sup> Daniel J. Wilson, review of Raymond Martin, The Past within Us: An Empirical Approach to Philosophy of History in The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 5 (December 1992), page 1487.

<sup>40</sup> Daniel J. Wilson, review of Raymond Martin, The Past within Us: An Empirical Approach to Philosophy of History in The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 5 (December 1992), page 1487.

<sup>41</sup> Lawrence Boadt, C.S.P., review of Richard Elliott Friedman, Who Wrote the Bible? in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, No. 2 (April 1989), pages 321-323.

<sup>42</sup> Suzanne Boorer, "The Importance of a Diachronic Approach: The Case of Genesis--Kings," the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, No. 2 (April 1989), pages 195-208.

<sup>43</sup> This and the following paragraph draw from Jose Faur, "God as a Writer: Omnipresence and the Art of Dissimulation," the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, No. 3/4 (Spring/Summer 1989), pages 31 and 39.

<sup>44</sup> ?? Students are invited to check what Gerda Lerner writes about educating Jewish women to read. Dr. Jirran thinks that she addresses the matter, but there is no reference to reading in the index and the table of contents is almost without a clue.

<sup>45</sup> Christopher R. Seitz, review of Hans Walter Wolff, Obadiah and Jonah: A Commentary, tr. Margaret Kohl in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, 1989, pages 139-141.

<sup>46</sup> Roger S. Boraas, review of Wayne T. Pitard, Ancient Damascus: A Historical Study of the Syrian City-State from Earliest Times until Its Fall to the Assyrians in 732 B.C.E. in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 51, No. 3 (July 1989), pages 536-538.

<sup>47</sup> Lima, Peru (AP), "Explorer: King Solomon's mines may have been in Peru," Daily Press, Thursday, December 7, 1989, page A 14, columns 1-6.

<sup>48</sup> This section relies on Mark A. Noll, "Bible Scholarship and the Evangelicals," the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 52, No. 3/4 (Spring/Summer 1989), pages 110-124.

<sup>49</sup>Marvin H. Pope, review of Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm., The Song of Songs: A Commentary on the Book of Canticles or the Song of Songs in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 54, No. 4 (October 1992), pages 758-761.

<sup>50</sup> Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm., The Song of Songs: A Commentary on the Book of Canticles or the Song of Songs page 105 as cited in the review by Marvin H. Pope in *the Catholic Biblical Quarterly*, Vol. 54, No. 4 (October 1992), page 759.

<sup>51</sup> Al Wolters, "Halley's Comet at a Turning Point in Jewish History," the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 55, No. 4 (October 1993), pages 687-697.

<sup>52</sup> A. T. Kraabel, review of Pieter W. Van Der Horst, Ancient Jewish Epitaphs: An Introductory Survey of a Millennium of Jewish Funerary Epigraphy (300 B.C.E.—700 C.E.) in the Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 55, No. 3 (July 1993), page 585. In December 2008, Joshua B. Lee, contacted me about a typographical error. I had written "the average of community college students," when I meant "the average age of community college students." It is nice to get feedback. From the spring of 1988 and through the fall of 1991 Lee studied Western Civilization, Black History, and Political Science with me. If only for getting back to me after twenty years, he is special.

<sup>53</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), p.116

<sup>54</sup> Kalyan Kumar Sarkar, review of Uma Chakravarti, The Social Dimensions of Early Buddhism in The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 3 (June 1991), page 891-892.

<sup>55</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), page 117.

<sup>56</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), page 830.

<sup>57</sup> The Concise Columbia Encyclopedia (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), page 191.

<sup>58</sup> Relies on Patricia Ebrey, "Cremation in Sung China," The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 2 (April 1990), pages 406-428.

<sup>59</sup> Relies on Patricia Ebrey, "Cremation in Sung China," The American Historical Review, Vol. 95, No. 2 (April 1990), pages 406-428.